

Examining Civil Society Organizations' Collaboration Paradox in Confronting Electoral Challenges in Enugu State, Nigeria, 1999-2020

Tobechukwu Chukwudifu Leo-Nnoli¹, Makodi Biereenu-Nnabugwu²

¹Department of Political Science, University of Nigeria, Nsukka, Nigeria

²Department of Political Science, Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka, Nigeria

Email: tobechukwu.chukwudifu@unn.edu.ng, mn.biereenunnabugwu@unizik.edu.ng

How to cite this paper: Leo-Nnoli, T. C., Biereenu-Nnabugwu, M. (2021). Examining Civil Society Organizations' Collaboration Paradox in Confronting Electoral Challenges in Enugu State, Nigeria, 1999-2020. *Open Journal of Political Science*, 11, 522-548. <https://doi.org/10.4236/ojps.2021.113034>

Received: May 22, 2021

Accepted: July 20, 2021

Published: July 23, 2021

Copyright © 2021 by author(s) and Scientific Research Publishing Inc.

This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution International License (CC BY 4.0).

<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>



Open Access

Abstract

Researches critical of electoral freedom and fairness, integrity, financing, and security in Nigeria have challenged Nigeria's democratization process. However, not many of them have captured these challenges considering the paradox of the civil society organizations' collaborations (CSOs) in Nigeria. We argued that for civil society to activate the democratization process, a historically structured imbalance through dualism of political and economic collaborations of the civil society should be resolved. The study made use of the Exploratory Research Design, using the Structural-Functional Analysis and the Post-Colonial State theory as frameworks for analyzing the imperative-ness of economic collaborations to direct the political collaborations. It made use of mixed method of data collection and analysis, using a sample of 312 respondents drawn from population of 1434 members of civil society organizations. We used the Multilinear Regression model in the Statistical Packages for the Social Sciences IBM (SPSS) version 20 to test the statistical hypothesis that: civil society organizations' uncordial relations with government organizations and their uncordial relations with business organizations are significantly related to their detection of electoral challenges in Enugu State, 1999-2020. It was found that civil society organizations' uncordial relationship with government organizations rather than uncordial relationship with business organizations is significantly related to help in detecting electoral challenges in Enugu State, 1999-2020.

Keywords

Motley, Collaboration Operational Collaboration, Paradoxical Collaboration, Democratization, Civil Society Organization, Electoral Challenges, Para-Politics, Post-Colonial State Theory, Structural-Functionalism, Political

1. Situating Civil Society Organization's (CSOs) Paradoxical Collaboration in Nigeria

The contradiction and disarticulation in the parity in the integration of civil society organizations in areas of governance and economy, or in conventional parlance—the state and market, in the tackling of electoral challenges (Ibeanu, 2006; Cernea, 1997), has not been given adequate attention in literature of civil society. While the economic collaboration which is theoretically foundational for operational collaboration has been difficult, their existent collaborative efforts have often been political, described as ad-hoc and motley (Ibeanu, 2012). In the collaborative zest of civil society organizations to tackle electoral challenges, civil society organizations such as NGOs are operationally diverse (Cernea, 1997), but the operationally diverse nature does not bring in good lessons for understanding their collaborations, whereby civil society organizations do not challenge the bad state of affairs or threaten capitalist development or anti-democratic developments of the capitalist state. Still, they do not question the appearances of international capitalism and class relations (Fernando, 2011), but form a united front against collaborations on ethno-religious state nationalism by playing them against each other in election (Ibeanu, 2006). This brings up a dualism which needs to be balanced towards economic collaborations described through the paradox of motley-operational collaboration, considering that political collaborations which dominate interactions are also not deep, continuous and consistent. Fernando (2011) stated that the NGOs do not question the in-balanced relationship between capital and labor in politically participatory ways that threaten capitalist development. Instead ethno-religious nationalism among them is played on to their own selfish whims and caprices. Such patterns of collaborations become their preoccupation which they leave to over-determine other interjections and hence undermining and neglecting deeper issues of class/labor relationship even in electoral contestations, the real political and economic realities confronting the people are not discussed. This exposes critical questions to be asked for collaboration of civil society with government and economic class for electoral challenges. More fundamentally is the need for a will on the economic class to solve electoral conundrum and in the area of collaboration as to be considered in civil society organizations.

Cernea (1997) looked at how this is requisite particularly in NGOs and noted that operational collaboration of NGOs which are part of the civil society organizations' programs and projects would also employ the local patterns, structures and strata of social organizations, in articulating and implementing projects and programs in areas of their comparative advantage. NGOs have comparative advantage in helping poor people to articulate their needs to government officials. They generally do this in areas of population, health and nutrition projects and

in voluntary resettlement of displaced people, which suggests more NGOs are needed in the area of increasing operational collaboration with political parties and industrial organizations to fight electoral challenges. Egbe (2004) hinted the importance of collaboration or associational life in civil society organizations, such that they are understood by their choices of interactive patterns with other organizations in the society. Be it state group or economic group interest, the civil society in other words, could work with the state in helping to find legal expressions and basis for confronting distribution of power through complex and creative relationships. Civil society organizations being political in the public interest could be part of a continuous legislative and even electoral process for state power acquisition. As civil society organizations behave like the state, it serves dual function or makes dual impacts as coercive function of the state and social reproductive function of the capitalist state. While this political and economic character of the civil society is brought to bear looking at democracy, in recent times, following the spate of political and economic crisis, alongside government ineptitude and apathy to ameliorate the hardship faced by the citizens in Nigeria, civil society organizations face challenges of grasping their rights under democracy, and to make a meaningful impact on either economic or political collaborations with out-group/organizations under democracy. The type of involvement of civil society in politics has been haphazard in the sense that stories of government-owned NGOs dominating welfarist activities, or development or rationalizing political actions in the other aspects of their activities while government moves around ceremoniously as seen in the Daily Star (Enugu State owned newspaper) reports from 2003 to 2018 (See Appendix). It is on this note that it becomes necessary to situate the collaboration of civil society organizations collaborations in Nigeria's democratization process.

1.1. Research Problem

Civil society organizations as para-political organizations help to make certain demands and give support under modern states practicing democracy. They are checks against the excesses of the government, human rights violations, abuse of the rule of law, monitoring of the application of the constitution; facilitators of participation and skills of all segments of the society; instillers of sense of tolerance, trust, hard work, moderation and compromise among the various parties in the society; alternatives to political parties; mitigating instruments against the excesses of fundamentalists, extremists and maximalists who tend to have a very narrow view of life, and; recruiting ground for and training of prospective members of the political class for the enhancement of quality participation in government (Diamond cited in Egbe, 2004). In the out-group interactions of civil society group with noncivil society organizations made up of the government and business organizations, a political and economic public space is created. Existing literature has not clearly made a paradoxical connection of political and economic contradictions interplay in the collaboration of civil society for democratization process in Nigeria, or how civil society organizations motley and op-

erational collaborations with external organizations such as the government and the business societies, influence or determine the most critical workings of democratization process, such as free and fair elections in Nigeria. It becomes a problem whereby operational collaboration of civil societies have been hampered, the societies that were supposed to be mobilized economically and politically became politically and economically separated and set against the other by primordial interests (Egbe, 2004; Ibeanu, 2012).

In recent times, it was observed that the citizenry has become almost handicapped to contribute to the democratic process visibly to feel economic advantages of democracy, thereby politically waiting for four years to make a meaningful impact on either economic or political collaborations with out-group organizations under democratic political system like Nigeria. A compendium of Daily Star Newspaper from 2013 to 2018 indicated organizations and interaction with the government did not indicate the presence of religious or ethnic organizations which are known to collaborate with the government in their operations. Rather, both political and economic collaborations were dominated by the activities of government driven nongovernmental organizations and development based organizations. Also, these political and economic activities of civil society organizations basically shadow the work of government in areas of development and welfare or activities rationalizing the actions of government in form of political support organizations. This condition has left out democratization through of civil society organizations in electoral education, and show disdain, and loss of focus on the democratic path. These collaborations become imbalanced and reflective of politics in general and have been economically incapable of distributing democratic dividends through proper electoral processes. The organizations have been incapable of evolving a democratic state through proper electoral processes. However, they have not functionally extricated the common political and economic vantages of the state to ensure the needed democratic freedoms. If there were such, they were not reported for the years (See Appendix).

Electoral malpractices and violence thus become the order of elections in Nigeria between 2003 and 2019. From the ongoing, the challenges of the democratization process have not been able to be holistically captured considering the motley-operational paradox of the civil society organizations in Nigeria. It is on this note that this study seeks to find out how did civil society organizations' motley and operational out-group collaborations associate with detection of electoral challenges in Enugu state, 1999-2020?

1.2. Research Reason

Nigeria has been witnessing electoral malpractices, electoral fraud, insecurity, and these have challenged Nigeria's democratization process. However, scholarship have questioned the input of the civil society organizations to its democratization process, but not many of them have investigated these challenges considering balancing the paradox of the civil society organizations' collaborations (CSOs) in Nigeria. The focus of this study becomes civil society organizations under the

time frame, from 1999 to 2020, to capture the longest sway of civilian administration in Nigeria, studying the long existing civil society organizations under the civilian administration since the later was coterminous to democratic administration within which its theoretical liberality allows electoral process, at the core of peoples' political participation, against military regimes as held by political theory.

1.3. Research Objective

Our research objective is to analyze the dialectics of civil society organizations' political and economic collaborations and their influences on tackling electoral challenges, 1999 to 2020.

2. Literature Review

2.1. Civil Society Organizations and Electoral Challenges

With a view to understanding the electoral process and civil society relationships, a scholar like [Schneckner \(2006\)](#) identified that civil society organizations have been playing crucial roles in determining and detecting electoral fraud as election observers. They are often trusted to confer legitimacy and increase trust, and thereby safeguard the electoral process against electoral fraud. He posited also that non-state actors such as marauding organizations, militias can also aggravate tensions to election leading to electoral fraud. [Marco \(n.d.\)](#), recommended the use of local forces by civil societies for the 2007 elections in Nigeria, this is because domestic election observers to the international observers possess more advantage which lies in their competence in bridging the language barriers and having numerical strength. However, the observation practically characterized civil society organizations as agents of electoral fraud detection, through indigenous means' and large size. [Common Wealth Human Rights Initiative \[CHRI\] \(2015\)](#) identified that in ensuring free and fair elections, there is a need to adopt international bodies such as the Common Wealth of Nations and the civil societies as partners. Based on this standpoint, civil society organizations are there to help reduce or annihilate the impact of corruption in society. Based on this conception, it is taken that civil society organizations also need to be in collaboration with international bodies as well to tackle electoral challenges. Also, [Noble and Morgan \(2012\)](#) posited that in particular; the media organization brings the needed substrate or landing for international collaboration. They also provide coverage of electoral issues and that a vast majority of fund from the Oversea Development Assistance (ODA) and other economic assistance from international development agencies or organizations from developed countries were only interested in collaborating with media organizations, and not directly with the. With these literatures, we find the place of electoral integrity, financing, security, freedom and fairness to be challenged by the incompetence of local institutions in Nigeria. Having ascertained the importance of organization large size, ability to confer trust and representing local initiatives, work with international bodies

and the media, and; requiring of huge financing, we shall review the forms of collaborations that generally represent these characters and in what forms they are, motley or operational.

2.2. Civil Society Organizations, Political and Economic Collaborations

Though without specific attention given to elections, collaborations have been asserted to require a plethora of factors, and actors in tackling electoral challenges in the society. These factors and actors take major forms that are either political or economic. In reality, they have taken several shapes, such as legislative engagements (Nwanolue & Iwuoha, 2012); miscellenous in good private or public practice (Gallagher & Wykes, 2014), and healthcare (World Health Organization [WHO], 2013). Specifically political and economic challenges could be overtaken with plausible focus on the legislative engagement of civil society organizations in the country. According to Nwanolue and Iwuoha (2012), the legislative engagement of civil societies that makes them initiators and executors and as well as beneficiaries of development is what should characterize the civil society in Nigeria. On this same issue of engagement, Gallagher and Wykes (2014) expounded that civil society among the multi stakeholders' engagement for good practice, while others are the private sector and the government. A good practice is a consultation process of engaging the people through commitment by actors, participation in program design, timely engagement of people, access to information by actors, giving gender awareness, capacity building of stakeholders, participation in decision making, implementation and monitoring. They hold civil society organizations to be partners of democratic governance alongside the business class and the government. This could be interpreted to mean that the civil society organizations do not operate in isolation for democratization to occur in the country. However, this position did not focus on civil society relations in electoral issues. World Health Organization [WHO] (2013), on this same grounds also skated over the importance of civil society organization electoral engagement, with its focus on health as they find that Civil society organizations, especially the nongovernmental organizations, together with the academia, professional associations and private sector to garner political support and mobilize the society on issues such as healthcare provision. For this view, "CSOs have several roles that they are uniquely placed to fulfil". (WHO, 2013: p. 30) This view upholds the idea that civil society organizations do not operate in a vacuum, they require the private sector for political support. It also stated what could be explained as a normative description of civil society organization. However, this view did not discuss the strength of this particular character of civil society organizations as regards Nigeria's democratization process.

While outlining the conditions, functions and the role of civil society such as holding government accountable, encouraging transparent governance, undertaking advocacy, engaging in consultations or negotiations during the peace process, mediating between different protagonists in a conflict, the Democratic

Progress Institute (2012) stated that the civil society alone cannot guarantee democracy. For this institute, the democratization process is a product of many factors with civil society as its pivot. The importance of the other segments of the society comes to light such as; government and the business class as well as supported by the *Literacy Watch Bulletin (2001)*, who in particular has buttressed the fact that civil society organizations do not work in isolation of other factors of democracy within a country or a society. While *Odo (2015)* was critical of the civil society organizations collaboration under military rule, he investigated democracy and good governance in Nigeria and made exposition on how certain critical elements (like democratic institutions of the civil society), were lacking when the military and political elites should have accommodated them. This led to breakdown of rules, gross misuse of power, erosion of human rights, disenfranchisement of the populace, excessively powerful regional governments and conspicuous consumption by politicians amidst abject poverty of Nigerian masses. For Odo, the absence of civil society organization collaboration has led to several negative effects on democracy and good governance in Nigeria. The challenge this brings to our study was that it was not focused on electoral challenges as an aspect of the democratization process in Nigeria, nor was it about comparing these challenges with the character of collaboration. In specific terms, some scholars have identified political and economic organizations that are important key players in civil society organization operational collaboration. For example, while *Ayatse, Onaga and Ogoh (2013)*, explained that good governance flows logically from the concept of governance, they nevertheless asserted that the major actors or agencies of government are the trio of the state, civil society and the private sector. This concurred with the other views that civil society organizations do not operate alone but with other actors to ensure good governance and democratic practice. However, it is limited in discussing the character of operational collaboration of civil society organizations in Nigeria's democratization process with a specific focus on how they grapple or tackle electoral challenges. The *Literacy Watch Bulletin (2001)* describes civil society organizations to have weak interactions with the government and the business class. This resulted in underperformance in both their basic functions and responsibilities to the people. Again this espies the strong influence the state and the economy have on the civil society organizations operating in Nigeria. The importance of this view is that it espies what other scholars have regarded as the private sector. Stating clearly that the business class is normatively involved in the civil society collaboration. Furthermore, there has been an increasing mediating role of civil society organizations in changing interactions of atomized individuals in the form of organized community organizations, which helps individuals derive greater benefits from government programs and market opportunities (*Uphoff & Krishna, 2004*). *Essia and Yearoo (2009)* identified that in developing countries like Nigeria, civil society organizations are more popular with donor organizations and that many donors' concern is that civil society organizations should be able to monitor public spending, thereby aiding the functioning of government

rather than being excessively critical of the state. They also identified the institutional problem of civil society organizations in Nigeria to be fundamentally dependent on external forces to create space for government-civil society interactions, as they are unclear, narrow, project-based and ad-hoc. They noted that government would be more willing to partner with civil society organizations that have capacity for budget work policy analysis, linkages and are financially able to contain its basic operations. They upheld that civil society has an undeniable role to play in model democracy. This view shows the particular dimension of the economic function of civil society organizations as supposed. While this view is also stating the importance of collaboration of civil society organizations with the government as well as other segments of the society, it departs from the normative views of former scholars which only stated the collaborative requisites of the civil society. This view is undoubtedly critical of the state of the civil society in Nigeria, however, it was not focused on the collaboration of the civil society in tackling electoral challenges in Nigeria, howbeit Enugu State Nigeria, 1999-2020.

3. Civil Society Organizations, between Operational and Motley Collaborations

With specific attention to the democratization process and its electoral challenges in Nigeria, nature of the political and economic contradictions constitute a snap-shot of organizational paradox in the unscientific placement of the political before the economic collaborations. This is described as motley collaboration (Ibeanu, 2006), collaborating pro-political collaborations with the state; (Ibeanu, 2012; Nwosu, 2014). Civil society organizations were bifurcated into those that were anti-military administration (anti-political and pro-political status quo). These organizations were in some sort of mobilized form to encourage the democratization process especially in the return to elective civil rule (Nwosu, 2014). Thus, their crucial roleplay in confronting the desire for an electoral civil rule cannot be underestimated. On the same hand, Ibeanu (2006) conceived the importance of economic organizations with its' non-collaborativeness with the civil society but with the government in the Niger Delta. Civil societies demonstrate the high incidence of inter-communal conflicts under military rule, with the tendency for military regimes and petrobusiness collaboration to instigate conflicts over resources between and among communities in the Delta. Thus democratic leadership is stripped from society. Even, civil society organizations are further busied in striving for peace and conflict mediation. In another light, mobilization is hindered within civil society organizations since the contradiction, disarticulation and incoherence of organizations rendering them incapacitated to collaborate or mobilize based on their class, with increase of overdeveloped state with the highly fractional political class, (especially of participation) exhibited in the post-colonial state in Africa spiraled into the civil society organizations and hindered democratization process in Nigeria, thus collaboration becomes ad-hoc, without recourse to economic mobili-

zation of organizations. The democratization process in Africa and Nigeria has been laden with contradictions of institutional structures of incoherence and marginal challenges, which in turn, purports the undermining of developmental issues.

Following this, Ibeanu (2012: p. 5) called for the need to “twist the divisive historical arm of capitalism in developing countries,” while analyzing the Nigerian civil society. For Ibeanu, the line of the democratization process, which is important to the working-class people, is guaranteed in the political defeat of capital and the proletarian state. A large population of the civil society membership, in their relations (being the working class), are still locked within primordial boundaries, limiting their mobility and availability for exploitation; which is necessary for the rise in working-class consciousness and national thinking (to realize true political and economic meanings of democracy.) Workers (advocates in the civil society organizations) remain largely divided. Some of their so-called leaders are now large merchants and entrepreneurs in both business and government-the petty bourgeoisie. This presents the incoherence of the civil society in the social relations of production. Finally, for the petty bourgeoisie, the democratization process is an authoritarian affair that peruse the civil society for their political and economic gains, through a very interventionist state dispensing privileges, freedoms and liberties to their benefits. In Nigeria, the petty bourgeoisie has emerged as the determinant/reigning class (to be distinguished from dominant/ruling class) also hijackers of Nongovernmental Organizations, and after independence, they were primarily identified amongst ad-hoc primordial organizations, particularly ethno-communal and religious organizations (only for quick political gains) (Ibeanu, 2012). The bastions of divide and rule politics and the champions of ethnic and religious politics, continue to thwart the orientations and mobilizing platforms of civil society organizations for maintaining power, stirring up conflicts and suppressing real advocacy of these same people’s rights.

Theoretical Framework

In this study, we developed our hypotheses through the theory of Structural-functionalism postulated by Talcott Parsons, and as developed for democratic societies and para-political organizations by Almond and Coleman (1960) as micro theory to understand the sub-systemic crises in levels of interest articulation, integration and aggregation into democratic governance. At the macro level of analytical framework, we used the Post-Colonial State Theory as propounded by Alavi (1972), as a macro theory to capture the state dialectics influencing the civil society organizations challenges in democracy and conception of state. The study remarks on the crises (paradox) of civil society organizations and; how this contributes externally to the developments of their interactions with the state. While the structural-functionalist theory by Almond and Coleman is most suitable for the study of para-political organizations (i.e. civil society organizations). Later, in a view to understanding political development, which

gives an apriori and process-viewpoint for understanding political systems, the structural-functional analysis was further developed. Almond and Powell (1966) argued that all political systems, regardless of their type, must perform a specific set of tasks to survive as systems called functional requirements. Some of these requirements being input and output functions were redefined with a deeper understanding of the political process. Various structures corresponding to these functions (input-output functions). Although the theory states that in a political system, political structures perform political structures, to evolve a structural-functional framework or theory, they posited that in various political systems, functions may be performed by diverse kinds of political structures and, sometimes, even by structures which are not overtly recognized as being, primarily, “political”. These input functions are political socialization and recruitment, interest articulation, interest aggregation and political communication. While the output functions are rule-making, rule-application and rule-adjudication. Of these, output functions, rulemaking, rule application and rule adjudication correspond to conventional governmental functions, performed by political or governmental organs such as the legislature, executive and judiciary respectively. The post-colonial state theory as the macro theory for the study holds on two characteristics of the post-colonial state in Africa. This argues that firstly, the post-colonial state in Africa was overdeveloped and could not properly mediate the class struggle. As Ake reinterpreted it, “the state was highly developed (overdeveloped) in the sense that it is very repressive and historically was not able to rise above class struggle to mediate between the opposing classes”, and that “the ruling classes of Africa are highly fractious: as they are juxtaposed in the different modes of production in intense quest for state power. (Ake, 1981: p. 128-129)

Understanding that organizations are functional parts of the society, that perform certain functions based on their level of integration with each other to make demands on the state system, we posit that organizational collaborations in electoral issues are fundamentally operational (functional) when they are continuous, economically oriented and aligned with material questions of the economy such as labor and class based questions. In this regard, the structural-functional analysis is crucial to study the situation of electoral objectives of political parties as part of the civil society (or para-political organizations) with the state and markets. It focuses on how a functional interest articulation, political socialization, political communication and interest aggregation is done to confront electoral challenges. On the macro level, both the state and market are studied by their level of contradictions and disarticulation, as given by the economic history of the Nigerian society emergence. The argument examines the dialectics in the collaboration of the civil society with the overdeveloped state and the less developed mode of production and the level of productive forces, present in the interactions of civil society organization memberships, as immobilized members of the proletarian class. Hence, the preponderance of political over economic collaborations in civil society.

4. Methodology

This study's scope was civil society organizations in Enugu State, Nigeria. The justification for selecting Enugu state has the highest number of registered civil society organizations according to the latest publication of civil society organizations and NGOs in South-Eastern, Nigeria by institute for Democracy in South Africa [IDASA-Nigeria]. Enugu is also an old metropolitan capital during the colonial era and sits perfectly connecting the five states of Nigerian known to have operated largely decentralized and democratic society-based governance in Nigeria. It is therefore expected to capture notable developments of civil society relations to Nigeria's democratization history. The Exploratory Research Design was used in this study. This is because of the study's recourse to combined method of data gathering. It also takes input from the qualitative and quantitative research typologies. The exploratory research design also makes use of case studies and wide range of literature review as done in this study, and at the end, the literature review brings out the areas that are more silent and neglected as well as more salient to be analyzed. Basically, this research design is classed under the quantitative research type (Biereenu-Nnabugwu, 2018).

The population of this study was 1434 members of four functional CSOs/NGOs. While this is so is because the number of registered and currently functioning civil society organizations in Enugu State was ascertained to be 4, from original total of 17. This study followed up the latest update of NGOs and civil society organizations in Nigeria by 2007 study of 17 but noted that only very few were functional since then. The study also admitted that there were many new civil society organizations that are yet to be registered and or qualitatively assured by international standards, thus could not be used for the study. The 4 civil society organizations were composed of about more than 30 staff members (internal members) and more than 1404 congregants (external members) who were on specific mission arrangement. The sample of 312 respondents was drawn from the population of 1434 members of organizations, using the Taro Yamane formula as stated below to make it more representative of that population rather than arbitrarily using 400. Data was collected with the help of survey method and documentary techniques and observation. Data was collected from both primary sources and secondary sources. The primary sources to be used are the contingency questionnaire and in-depth interviews, while the secondary sources were journal articles, textbooks, book chapters, periodicals, official documents, unpublished theses, dissertations and internet materials. The researcher also visited one of the organizations as a participant non-obstrusive observer.

4.1. Administration of Instruments

Purposive Sampling was adopted in the study to get the required number of 6 societies that are eligible for sampling. It is a non-probability sampling technique we discovered that they saw societies in Enugu state as updated and recorded by Institute for Democracy in South Africa [IDASA-Nigeria] a total number of 48

civil society organizations. We took note of these organizations, and they were categorized into 6 which were ethnic political organizations trade organizations right-based organizations professional bodies town unions and faith-based organizations. From this population of civil society organizations or organizations, Enugu had the highest number with a total of 17 registered civil society organizations, followed by Imo, Abia, Ebonyi and Anambra States respectively. This study reduced the number of civil society organizations in Enugu, from a total of 17 to 4 organizations, using certain necessary criteria which are necessary criteria which are influenced by the study. In order to get the legal, active, current and experienced through the years under study, civil society organizations that were involved in specific missions which were registered with the Corporate Affairs Commission, currently handling a project and that has run a number of ten (10) years with the experience were identified and selected from the total listed 17 civil society organizations in Enugu State 2007.

Ratio system was used to determine the sharing of the respondents of inactive staff and congregants in the same society organizations' missions. After allocation to about 312 samples, 250 questionnaire copies were distributed and 113 were returned. For Women Aids Collective, WACOL, about 22 students who were 18 years and above were selected from 4 Senior Secondary Schools in Enugu State where Childs' Right advocacy training was conducted, out of which 102 students made the list and 2 staff members were sampled as part of the 102. For Catholic Institute for Development, Justice and Peace CIDJAP respondents to be sampled needed were 43% who involved in the training at Oru-Aka-Di-Mma environmental projects out of which 17 were staff respondents CIDJAP had a training of about 1000 people, about a batch of 500 trainees as congregants were ascertained to be already actively working as cleaners, and more than 250 questionnaires were distributed to them throughout the state in Nsukka and Enugu city. For Society for the Improvement of Rural Persons SIRP, they had a total of about 500 congregants during an outreach for the training on drug abuse at Obollo Afor and establishment of Adullam Centre and 5 persons were selected out as paid staff or the internal members, making a total of 505 members. However, with the ratio to the sample population of 321, 110 SIRP members were selected after distribution of 200 questionnaire copies. For the Anglican Communion Synod Project at Ngwo Enugu community, a total of 67 persons were selected from the sample population of 312, after distribution of 150 copies of questionnaire, within which 6 representatives of SYNOD 2018 participants who were also members of the host church of Anglican Communion Office (St. Thomas Anglican Church Ngwo) were sampled, as internal members for the Anglican Communion.

In the administration of qualitative analysis techniques, specifically a content analysis of documents such as instances in Newspapers in Enugu State (The Daily Star) for some years back from 2003-2018 was done. This four year media review focused on current news prints from an Enugu State based news media. (See Appendix for summary **Table A1**). An interview was conducted on key

persons of civil society organizations. The questions were asked by the interviewer with the camera focused on their faces, and hands to get their gestures which may also help give away certainty in their answers. The questions were posed without leads-on to any positive or negative response, especially considering the dualism in the questions. The key question asked was as follows; Do you think your civil society organizations' collaboration with government and economic organizations hinders their supposed role on electoral challenges in Enugu state, 1999-2020?

4.2. Validation/Reliability of the Instruments

A pilot survey was done using a random sample of 30 persons from 4 civil society organizations which were one (1) rights-based NGO group, one (1) community-based NGO group and two (2) faith-based organizations answered 40 causality test questions, with 6 (six) demographic-based questions, after which corrections were made. About 30 observations were considered to be adequate and would not significantly affect this study. These steps were carefully taken as well, the Cronbach's alpha was set at 8.24 alpha level which is greater than 7 considered to be good, with this the determination of the common factor load analysis was also done, the 40 questionnaire items were collapsed into 15 items (i.e. 5 demography based and 10 subject-matter based, testing causality). The content and face validations were also determined by professionals in statistical analysis and political science research.

4.3. Method of Data Analysis

This study used the mixed method. It involved triangulating of the qualitative analysis and quantitative analysis (Leege & Francis, 1974). This enabled the study to involve qualitative and quantitative interpretation of views from several documents and direct views of persons. The data was analyzed, supported by triangulation with use of inferential statistical tools like Common Factor Analysis (especially to check internal consistency within group questionnaire items and between organizations of questionnaire items for pilot study, whereby, invalid questionnaire items would be dropped in the course of the analysis.)

Multiple Linear Regression Analysis was used and IBM (SPSS) 20.0 would also be used. This was supported with the use of Qualitative Descriptive statistical tools like tables and pie charts, figures and pictures with descriptive statistical tools like mean, mean deviation, standard deviation, percentages. We therefore tested the following hypotheses.

H0: Civil society organizations' motley and operational collaborations are not significantly related to detecting electoral challenges in Enugu State, 1999-2020.

H1: Civil society organizations' motley and operational collaborations are significantly related to detecting electoral challenges in Enugu State, 1999-2020.

Test Statistic: The Multiple Linear Regression Analysis.

Significance Level: A significance level (α) of 0.05 was used in testing this hypothesis.

Table 1. Model summary.

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	0.155 ^a	0.024	0.018	0.41826

a. Predictors: (Constant), Is your relationship with government not cordial?, Is your interaction with business organizations not cordial?

Table 2. ANOVA.

Model	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1 Regression	1.327	2	0.663	3.792	0.024 ^b
1 Residual	54.058	309	0.175		
Total	55.385	311			

a. Dependent Variable: Does your group help in detecting electoral challenges? b. Predictors: (Constant), Is your relationship with government not cordial?, Is your interaction with business organizations not cordial?

Table 3. Coefficients.

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	T	Sig.
	B	Std. Error	Beta		
(Constant)	1.120	0.104		10.765	0.000
1 Is your interaction with business organizations not cordial?	-0.042	0.048	-0.049	-0.865	0.388
Is your relationship with government not cordial?	0.139	0.053	0.148	2.633	0.009

a. Dependent Variable: Does your group help in detecting electoral challenges?

4.4. Results

Multiple linear regression analysis was conducted to evaluate the prediction of [organizations' help in detecting electoral challenges] from [Organizations' uncordial relationship with business organizations and Organizations' uncordial relationship with government]. The results of the multiple linear regression analysis revealed the independent variables were statistically significant predictors to the model at $p < 0.05$ i.e. $p < 0.024$. Although, the result showed that the model explained 2.4% of the variance in the dependent variable (i.e. organizations' help in detecting electoral challenges) (see **Table 1** above) which means that 98% of the variation cannot be explained by the independent variables alone, the model was a significant predictor of the dependent variable, $F(2, 309) = 3.792$, $p = 0.024$. (See **Table 2**) While Organizations' uncordial relationship with government contributed significantly to the model ($B = 0.139$, $p = 0.009$), (**Table 3** above) Organizations' uncordial relationship with business organizations did not ($B = -0.042$, $p = 0.388$). The organizations' help in detecting electoral challenges suggests that with each increase in organizations' help in detecting electoral chal-

lenges, organizations' non-cordial relationship with government increases approximately by 0.139 units and organizations' uncordial relationship with business organizations decreases approximately by -0.042 .

All civil society organizations agree that motley collaboration, that is political collaboration, influences electoral challenges. The civil society organizations rarely collaborate with organizations economic relationships to tackle electoral challenges. This collaboration goes mainly but on individual levels, or by forms of miscellaneous groups, just like some of the organizations under study. To substantiate this, many organizations agree to meeting with government organizations to charge against electoral challenges only during election years. This shows that electoral challenges were not only born out of motley collaboration with government organizations' interaction, but was also through the absence of operational-collaboration with economic organizations. Electoral fraud and violence could only be checked by arrangements whereby funds and finances are mobilized against it through economically based or sufficient organizations. They have often mobilized with political class or collaborated with them to tackle electoral issues, but have rarely collaborated with business persons, organizations, engaged economically with organizations and building capacities, or using form of industrialist backed lobby or party financing, to tackle electoral challenges like vote buying, fraud, thuggery, violence, falsification of results and so on. There is a significant relationship between motley-operational economic collaboration of civil society organizations and electoral challenges. A respondent for faith-based organization shows this when asked about their organizational collaboration with political and economic organizations (See **Table 4** below).

The first interviewee showed that collaboration is done only in election time and not economic or operational as political collaborations were more indicated. The implication was that there was disparity in collaboration with organizations alone (i.e. distinctiveness/special sessions) In like manner, the second interviewee showed through the responses that there was more of political collaborations, thus according to this study indicated to be motley. The interpretation was that there was disparity in collaborating with government class (number of meeting encounters) as they were continuous in with the legislature engagement but ad-hoc with market organizations. Hence, a continuous political engagement with ad-hoc economic engagement, time for law drafting did not include engagement with market organizations meant disparity in the tackling of electoral issues by collaboration with other organizations. The third interviewee also was indicative of political motley encounters or collaborations. This is because with the absence of parity in collaboration with organizations, (not distinctively arranged), engagement was done only in election time, hence, it was motley and less operational, that is, lacking engagement with economic organizations for election challenges presents a sustainable key for operational engagement (See **Table 4** below).

Table 4. Analysis of interview sessions with representatives of civil society group staff members.

Organization	Motley	Operational	Context	interpretation	Tackling electoral challenges	interpretation
A	PRESENT Political collaborations were more indicated	N/A	<i>At least, those things are best talked about within an election period. It is not that ordinarily we cannot mention it if the need arises but, it is best discussed during an election period, so that we sensitize people and tell them this and this are what you are supposed to do as people who are called to be separate, who are special people and should not join others to commit electoral fraud, we should give it as an advice, we have to talk to them because like I said unless an issue comes up aside the period that is electoral, election period, people may not know the reason why you are talking about it. It's a sort of sensitization. (S. Nwankwor, personal communication, December 7, 2020).</i>	Absence of Parity in collaboration with organizations alone (i.e. and in no distinctive gathering, manner	PRESENT	Collaboration is done only in election time and not operational
B	PRESENT Political collaborations were indicated to be motley	N/A	<i>Now I want to give you an instance, there is this law that was thrown into force in 2017 in Enugu State by the instruction of Human Justice Law. [Organization] not only participated in the drafting of the law, I am a trained drafts man. Being a representative of [the Organization], I participated from day one, all the interactive sessions till when the law was finally presented to his excellency and he signed it into law. We didn't stop there, we carried the news of the existence of that law to the Ogbete main market for instance, called the market traders together, those of them who understand what being a good citizen is all about. (H. C. Onaga, personal communication, December 7, 2020).</i>	Disparity in continuous collaborating (continuous with the legislature engagement (political group) but ad-hoc with market organizations	PRESENT	Continuous political engagement with ad-hoc economic engagement, time for law drafting did not include engagement with market organizations.
C	PRESENT Indicative of political motley encounters or collaborations	N/A	<i>And so we are on ground by 2023 to make sure that the number of women coming out to contest for positions in the various levels of government is in raised by at least 30% that's all that... Our stakeholders include all women organizations in churches assuming that next August meeting we are going to be visiting all the churches and it going to help during the August meetings at the level of the parties, we also want to be able to share with them and tell them that research has proven that countries that reckon with women, their gross domestic product is always very high, then look at Nigeria because they don't want them to copy but they always think women do not mean anything but they are better managers so these are the things (C. Ugwu, personal communication, December 7, 2020).</i>	Disparity in collaboration with organizations, (engagement with organizations was not distinctively arranged)	PRESENT	Engagement was done only in election time, hence, it was motley and less operational (engagement with economic organizations for election challenges presents a sustainable key for operational engagement)

4.5. Summary of the Findings

It was found that that civil society organizations' motley collaboration significantly relates to the tackling of electoral challenges. While the regression results show that, the members of civil society organizations admit to having issues in the collaboration with government organizations and politicians especially regarding tackling electoral challenges, the in-depth interviews show that civil society organizations seldom meet with the political class, in areas of policy, but not always regarding electoral issues, except on electioneering season. However, the economic collaboration which denotes the operational collaboration of civil society was admitted to be on individual bases and atomistic basis of engagements. It was found that out-group civil society organizations' economic collaborations were motley, ad-hoc, and not continuous as regards issues on electoral challenges. Generally, it was assumed by this study that some of the unexplained causality between the independent and dependent variables of the statistical analysis was made by the interview responses and interpretations from documents. It was also observed that the questions on the contradictory part of the paradox showed no correlation were admitted to in the interview responses. This makes it pertinent for calls to be made to interrogate those balancing aspects of the civil society organizations paradoxical collaborations and consolidate on them speed up the democratization process, especially in low income countries (See Appendix).

5. Conclusion

In conclusion, it could be gleaned from the study that civil society organizations in Enugu state Nigeria, collaborate with the state more than the market as represented by different groups, industries, firms and private and profit ventures for tackling electoral challenges in low income states. The inability to balance the political and economic paradox has been described as the motley collaboration. We have argued through the literature that since the modern government just like other new states practicing democracy promotes only the capitalist values and cultures. The galvanizing religious and ethnic peculiarities for democratic practice, through questions in the societal material peculiarities are untapped to exude and demonstrate the local meaning of democracy. Because such issues may bring up realities of the citizenry which are class and labor based for true democracy (See [Fernando, 2011](#)). Today, nationalistic oriented societies are using both religious and economic situation to confront democracy in Nigeria. But they still lack the local economic basing and sustainability. It could be gleaned also from the findings that civil society organizations in Enugu State have a motley collaboration with political organizations than with economic organizations when dealing with electoral challenges. The survey data highlighted such association of lack of operational collaboration of civil society with economic and business organizations and presence of electoral challenges (See [Table 2](#)).

Civil society should be continuous in their economic and political engagements

for the sole purpose of making an impact in the democratization process in the area of election. Apart from the general issue of ideology, practical issues of capacity, impactful issues drive one to opine that election is the core of the democratization process and such should be the concern of civil society organizations when interacting with out-organizations. This could be construed in two ways, society as a group seeking the use of political organizations and economic organizations to achieve a political end. While it is noted that civil society has not been continuously associative with political organizations, but also not cordial, adhoc, haphazard and short-lived in collaboration concerning electoral issues, they have been hindered totally in economic collaborations concerning electoral challenges with better education of the economic organizations on the several ways their collaborative efforts could help tackle electoral challenges in Enugu State as well as Nigeria. Here, the importance of lobby of the legislature, advocacy support on electoral issues, party support against fraud machines, and political monitoring of legislative processes (indirect elections of representative democracy), financing and monitoring of electoral tribunals, party finance monitoring, election monitoring through either of these collaborations with the civil society is key to help tackle the electoral challenges and speed up the democratization process. These continuous collaborations as well require ethno-cultural solidarity and professional communicative capacity engagement as well.

Acknowledgements

We thank the organizations that gave us audience. These were the Society for the Improvement of the Rural Persons (SIRP), The Anglican Communion registered by Enugu North Diocese, and; the Catholic Institute for Development, Justice and Peace (CIDJAP). We also use this medium to appreciate individual sponsors; Prof. Biereenu-Nnabugwu, Makodi, Dr. Leonard and Dr. (Mrs.) Lois Nnoli.

Conflicts of Interest

The authors declare no conflicts of interest regarding the publication of this paper.

References

- Ake, C. (1981). *A Political Economy of Africa*. Onitsha: Longman Group.
- Alavi, H. (1972). The State in Post-Colonial Societies. *New Left Review*, 74, 59-81.
- Almond, G. A., & Coleman, J. S. (1960). *The Politics of the Developing Areas*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Almond, G. A., & Powell, B. G. (1966). *Comparative Politics: A Developmental Approach*. Boston, MA: Little Brown & Co.
- Ayatse, F. H., Onaga, U. B., & Ogoh, A. O. (2013). Democracy, Good Governance and Development: Nigeria's Experience. *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 8, 61-67.
- Biereenu-Nnabugwu, M. (2018). Thoughts and Perspectives on Research Designing in Political Inquiry. *Socialscientia Journal of the Social Sciences and Humanities*, 3, 1-21.
- Cernea, M. M. (1997). *Nongovernmental Organizations and Local Development*. World

- Bank Discussion Papers. Washington DC: World Bank.
- Common Wealth Human Rights Initiative [CHRI] (2015). *Civil Society and the Commonwealth Reaching For Partnership: A Report of the International Advisory Commission*. New Delhi: Common Wealth Human Rights Initiative.
- Democratic Progress Institute [DPI] (2012). *Civil Society Mediation in Conflict Resolution*. Working Paper, London: Democratic Progress Institute.
- Egbe, M. E. (2004). *The State and the Civil Society in Nigeria. A Case Study of the Movement for the Survival of the Ogoni People (MOSOP)*. Lagos: Nigeria Institute of International Affairs.
- Essia, U., & Yearoo, A. (2009). Strengthening Civil Society Organizations /Government Partnership in Nigeria. *International NGO Journal*, 4, 368-374.
- Fernando, J. L. (2011). *The Political Economy of NGOs: State Formation in Sri Lanka and Bangladesh*. New York, NY: Pluto Press.
- Gallagher, M., & Wykes, S. (2014). *Civil Society Participation in the Sustainable Energy for All Initiative: A Survey of Six Countries*. Rugby: Practical Action Publishing.
- Ibeanu, O. (2006). *Civil Society and Conflict Management in Niger Delta: Scoping Gaps for Policy and Advocacy*. Final Report: Monograph Series, Abuja: CLEEN Foundation (Centre for Law Enforcement Education).
- Ibeanu, O. (2012). *From Native to Citizen to Indigene: Reflections on National Unity and Constitutional Review in Nigeria* being a Paper Delivered at the NnamdiAzikwe University, Akwa.
- Leege, D. C., & Francis, W. L. (1974). *Political Research: Design, Measurement, and Analysis*. New York, NY: Basic Books.
- Literacy Watch Bulletin (2001). *Enhancement of Local NGO Capacity Building*. <https://docplayer.net/15652161-literacy-watch-bulletin.html>
- Marco, D. C. (Ed.) (n.d.). *Resource Directory of Nigerian Civil Society Organizations and a Listing of Stakeholders for the 2007 Elections*. Abuja: IDASA Funded By DFID Nigeria.
- Noble, K., & Morgan, C. (2012). *Country Case Study: South Sudan Support to Media Where Media Freedoms and Rights Are Constrained*. London: BBC Media.
- Nwanolue, B. O. G., & Iwuoha, V. C. (2012). Democratic Consolidation and Challenges of Legislative Politics in Nigeria: A Political Economy Approach. *Singaporean Journal of Business Economics, and Management Studies*, 1, 1-14. <https://doi.org/10.12816/0003738>
- Nwosu, B. U. (2014). Two Faces of Civil Society and the Military in Nigeria's Democratization. *Research on Humanities and Social Sciences*, 4, 153-164.
- Odo, L. U. (2015). Democracy and Good Governance in Nigeria: Challenges and Prospects. *Global Journal of Human Social Science (F)*, 15, 1-9.
- Schneckner (2006). *Fragile Statehood, Armed Non-State Actors and Security Governance*. Geneva: Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces (DCAF).
- Uphoff, N., & Krishna, A. (2004). Civil Society and Public Sector Institutions: More than a Zero-Sum Relationship. *Public Administration and Development*, 24, 357-372. <https://doi.org/10.1002/pad.313>
- World Health Organization [WHO] (2013). *A Global Brief on Hypertension, Silent Killer, Global Public Health Crisis*. Geneva: WHO Press.

Appendix

Daily star, 2003-2018 civil society activities in Enugu state, Nigeria.

Table A1. Civil society organizations and dialectics democratization in Nigeria.

S/N	Name of C.S.O	News headline	Issue in news	References
1	Civil resource development and documentation centre	Cirddoc seeks to partner crmc	Reiteration of readiness and determination to partner with crmc in village mediation programmes	Cyril Ozor Page 1 December 27 2017
2	Non-academic staff union of universities	Nasu embarks on indefinite strike	Indefinite strike declared by joint action committee of non-teaching staff trade union	Cyril Uzor. Page 3 Mon-21-Sun 27 August 2017
3	asuu	ASUU appeals to students, parents for understanding	Appeal to parents and students to understand the position of Asuu for better conditions of teaching and learning.	Cyril Uzor Page 3 August 28-Sept 3, 2017
4	women information network (winet)	WINET takes advocacy to house	Advocacy for health immunization	Lizzy Achuagu Page 8 Dec. 25-Dec 31, 2017
5	inspire nurses network africa	Nigeria nurses lack life support skills	Emphasis on the need for training on emotional intelligence and critical thinking	News agency of Nigeria Page 25 Dec 31, 2017
6	Nigeria union of journalists(NUJ)	NUJ president sues for peace	Legal action against Enugu state council of the union	Sebastine Okafor Page 2 Dec 18-24, 2017
7	Carmelite prisoner's interest organization (CAPIO)	NGO Advocates knowledge of ACJL	Lecture on indept knowledge of the administration of criminal justice law by traditional rulers	Emeka Nebeife Page 2 Dec 18-24, 2017
8	National council of Enugu state students	NACESS commends Ugwuanyi	Commendation of Ugwuanyi for his support to the body.	Sebastine Okafor Dec 18-24, 2017
9	Catholic Men organization	CMO honors will of departed members	Urge to show commitment towards the progress of the organization and the development of the church	Ben Unegbu Page 18 Dec 11-17, 2017
10	United progressive party	Upp leader laments vote monetization	Need to pass necessary laws that will usher in full electronic voting system	Emeka Ugwuoke Page 3 Nov 27-Dec 3, 2017
11	Citizens rights and mediation centre	CRMC governing council wants colliery avenue rehabilitated	The governing council of CRMC urges ministry of works to rehabilitate colliery avenue.	Cheta Igwesi Page 6 August 14-20, 2017
12	Medical Women association of Nigeria	MWAN submits biannual report	Organization of free cervical and breast cancer screening for women	Ifeoma Ogbu Page 6 Nov 6-12, 2017
13	Imago Dei charity initiative (IDCI)	NGO Makes case for the needy	Assistance to the aged, orphans, widows and widowers in visited areas	Nneka Ahanonu Page 2 Nov 20-26, 2017
14	Medical women association of Nigeria	MWAN organizes free cancer screening	Organization of free cancer screening for women	Ifeoma Ogbu Page 6 Nov 6-12, 2017
15	Federation of women lawyers (FIDA)	FIDA visits Government house	Commendation by state government for their work in promoting and protecting the rights of women and child	Nnaemeka Ikpe Page 8 Nov 6-12, 2017

Continued

16	Nsukka diocesan Christian men organisation	Nsukka diocesan CMO celebrates silver jibilee	Silver jubilee celebration at the catholic cathedral parish in Nsukka.	Nwasogwa Godwin Page 18 October 9-15, 2017
17	Footprints community healthcare	Enugu south expectant mothers receive gifts	Free medical tests and presentation of free kits and other gift items to pregnant women	Anthonia Okafor Page 2 October 1-8, 2017
18	Social inclusion movement	V4C/DFID seek CRMC partnership	DFID seeks to partner with citizens rights mediation centre	Chike Igwesi Page 5 October 25-1 November, 2017
19	Committee of local government council members	CCM lauds appointments	Commandment of the governor on appointments	Cyril Ozor Page 5 October 25-November 1, 2017
20	Youth child support initiative (YCSI)	YCSI,USAID, HDI hold workshop for education stakeholders	Sensitization workshop to enhance participants knowledge of basic information about matching grants	Ifeoma Ogbu Page 6 September 25-October 1, 2017
21	The inter-party adversary council (IPAC)	IPAC gets new exco	Re-election of its chairman for another one year in office	Emeka Ugwuoke Page 9 Sept 25-Oct 1, 2017
22	The rotary club of new heaven-district 9142	Rotary club installs new president	Installation of engineer Charles Odili as its 23 rd president for the year 2017-2018	Uche Eneje Page 5 Sept 11-17, 2017
23	National association of traditional medicine practitioners (NANTMP)	NANTMP reacts to NARD strike	Caution to members of the association to be alive to their duties	Chris Ugwuoke Page 6 Sept 11-17, 2017
24	Citizen Rights and Mediation Centre (CRMC)	CRMC governing council inspects Enugu office	On the spot assessment of the facilities on ground at the new office of the centre	Ifeoma Ogbu Page 3 July 30 th , 2017
25	National association of Traditional Medicine Practitioners	NANTMP lauds ENHA	Congratulations to members of Enugu state house of assembly over the passage of Enugu state health reform bill.	Cyril Ozor July 9, 217
26	Sports writers association of Nigeria	SWAN commends minister, NOC	Commandment of Solomon Dalung for approving the association as associate members of National sports federation	Obert Okolie July 9, 2017
27	The association of Enugu state development unions	AESDU elects Officers	Election of new executive to pilot the affairs of the association	Nwanneka Ikpe July 9 th , 2017
28	National agency for the prohibition of trafficking in persons (NAPTIP)	NAPTIP visits Ugwuanyi	Recollection of the cooperation and support of the government and people of Enugu state	Chikodili Okey June 19-25, 2017
29	Calvary foundation institute of technology	CAFITECH matriculates students	Matriculation ceremony for new students	Beneth Uche Page 6 June 12-18, 2017
30	Christian association of Nigeria (CAN)	CAN visits Lion building	Visitation to Ugwuanyi over herdsmen attack	Nnaemeka Ikpe Page 8 June 12-18, 2017
31	Nigeria association of Women Journalists (NAWOJ)	NAWOJ-election-Chibota wins National VP zone c	Election of Chibota as national vice president	Oluchukwu Nnamani Page 17 June 12-18, 2017
32	National Union of Teachers (NUT)	NUT elects new executives	Election of Mr Theophilus Odo as the chairman of NUT, Enugu state chapter	Obert Okolie Page 13 August 6-12, 2018

Continued

33	The women Tower Foundation	Foundation presents Gburugburu schools challenge	Presentation of Gburugburu school's challenge in Enugu north senatorial district.	Chris Ugwuja Page 13 August 6-12, 2018
34	Universal Learning Solutions (ULS)	ULS partners ENSUBEB on literacy	Partnership deal to deliver intensive training on literacy level to the teachers and dedicated government officials of Enugu state	Chijioke Madumelu Page 22 August 6-12, 2018
35	Ositadinma Foundation	Widows hail Ositadinma Foundation	Expression of gratitude to pastor beloved Dan Obi Anike for his humanitarian gesture	Micheal Alobu Page 3 July 30-August 5, 2018
36	Christian Association of Nigeria (CAN)	CAN suspends protest match	Postponement till further notice of its planned peaceful protest match slated for July, 11	Ben Unegbu Page 18 July 9-15, 2018
37	Youth initiative for sustainable human development in Africa	NGO trains youths	Training of 50 youths on self-discovery, emotional intelligence and career advancement	Cyril Ozor Page 2 July 2-8, 2018
38	Ugo touch of life foundation (U-TOLF)	U-TOLF storms Igbo-eze north on free medical outreach	Official visit of Mrs Ugwuanyi to Igbo-eze north for free medical outreach	Chris Ugwuja Page 5 June 25-July 1, 2018
39	Association of Community Pharmacist of Nigeria (ACPN)	ACPN destroys expired drugs	Destruction of drugs worth #452 million in FCT	Chukwudi Nweke Page 16 June 25-July 1, 2018
40	Ugo-Touch of life Foundation	U-TOLF donates drugs to 17 LGA'S	Donation of drugs by Ugwuanyi Monica to the ministry of health for distribution to 17 local government area in Enugu state	Nnaemeka Ikpe Page 8 June 18-24, 2018
41	Youth council of Nigeria	Youth council visits committee chairman	Commendation of Hon. Paul Nnaji for, chairman house committee on information for his good work	Anthonia Okafor Page 7 August 6-12, 2018
42	Rotary club international	Rotary club international honors governor	Decoration of Gov. Ugwuanyi with its prestigious "Distinguished service award of excellence in governance"	Nnaemeka Ikpe Page 8 August 6-12, 2018
43	Coalition of United political parties (CUPP)	CUPP inaugurates secretariat	Formal opening of national secretariat and inauguration of 15-member steering committee to pilot the affairs of the coalition	Amechi Nwede Page 9 August 6-12, 2018
44	Abakpa-Nike market traders association (AMATA)	AMATA boss bemoans state of the nation	Expression of worry over the degeneration into military dictatorship of Nigeria's democracy	Emeka Nebeife Page 5 August 1-26, 2018
45	Nigeria society of engineers	NSE commends Ugwuanyi's intervention on Milliken hill road	Commendation of Ugwuanyi for reconstructing and modernizing the historic Milliken hill federal road in Ngwo	Emmanuel Okafor Page 13 August 13-19, 2018
46	Association of National accountants of Nigeria	ANAN donates over #3 m books to CCU	Donation of books worth over three million to the coal city university to expand the framework for credible and high quality professional accountancy organization	Francis Igata Page 20 August 13-19, 2018
47	Enugu state youth movement	Youth group visits local government Boss	Pledging of un alloyed support for the movement by Sunday Ugwu of Enugu south	Nneka Ahanonu Page 6 August 6-12, 2018

Continued

48	Ugochi touch of life foundation	U-tolf goes to Ukana	Visit of the governor's wife to Ukana for women empowerment, girl-child education, maternal health care and free health services	Paffela Chinegwu Page 5 June 4-10, 2018
49	National council of women societies	NCWS organizes seminar	Seminar on ethics and value change organized at Universal hotel, Enugu	Lizzy Aniagu Page 5 June 4-10, 2018
50	Centre for world University Ranking	CWUR rates UI high	Ranking of University of Ibadan as the 991 st worldwide and 14th in Africa	Uzo Ugwunze Page 13
52	Joint health sector union	JOHESU calls for sack of health minister	A call on Buhari by the union to sack Prof Isaac Adewale	Chukwudi Nweke Page 39 May 29-June 3, 2018
53	Nigeria Medical association	NMA accuses JOHESU of sabotage	NMA accuses JOHESU of sabotage and fabricating stories making outrageous demands from FG	Chukwudi Nweke Page 39 May 29-June 3, 2018
54	National association of Nigeria traditional medicine practitioners	NANTMP visits Willie Obiano	A call by Dr Eugene Elili to the association to maintain peace and avoid causing division in the zone	Amechi Nwede Page 3 May 21-27, 2018
55	Ononenyi health care foundation	Nkanu east constituency goes agog	Successful hosting of third round of free medical and health outreach	Maria Obiora Page 19 May 21-27, 2018
56	Pentecostal fellowship of Nigeria	PFN threatens showdown if:	Threat to embark on a massive protest if the federal government fails to halt the killing of Christians in the middle belt	Uzo Ugwunze Page 18 May 7-13, 2018
57	Trade union congress	TUC governor lauds governor	Commendation of Ugwuanyi for giving listening ear and agreeing to implement request	Sebastine Okafor Page 3 April 23-29, 2018
58	Wateraid Nigeria	Wateraid organizes 3-day seminar	3-day training on financial management for its local government partners in Enugu state	Lizzy achuagu Page 3 September 17-23, 2018
59	International press centre	IPC sets up field monitors	Setting of field monitors in the six geopolitical zones of the country	Lizzy Achuagu Page 3 September 17-23, 2018
60	Wateraid Nigeria	Wateraid holds monitoring and evaluation training	Opening of monitoring and evaluation training for Enugu local government partners held at Toscana hotels, Enugu	Lizzy Achuagu Page 3 September 24-30, 2018
61	Human development initiative	NGO, HDI organize public dialogue	Dialogue on the outcome of comparative analysis of Enugu state SUBEB 2014 action plan and project implementation at Universal hotel, Enugu	Ifeoma Ogbu Page 3 September 24-30, 2018
62	Connected Development	CODE lauds World bank's intervention	CODE applauds the world bank over its 611 million dollars support to the federal government to get out of school children into classrooms across the country	Chukwudi Nweke Page 16 September 24-30, 2018
63	Sports writers association of Nigeria	SWAN boss lauds Olympic grant	Commendation of the initiative of the Nigeria sports development fund Inc to raise #900 million to support athletes	Nobert Okoli Page 23 April 23-29, 2018

Continued

64	African technology studies network (ATPS)	ATPS introduces mobile farming app	Introduction of land information mobile app that determines soil information and climate characteristics on agricultural production	Cyril Ozor Page 3 April 9-15, 2018
65	Hope for African child initiative	NGO donates books to rural school	Donation of books to community primary/secondary school, Crystal bridge Academy Ogbelle-Obollo, Udenu local government	Chinenye Ozor Page 2 April 2-8, 2018
66	National youth council of Nigeria	NYCN canvasses 30% affirmative action for youths	A call by comrade Obinna Nwaka for a 30% affirmative action for Nigerian youths in all spheres of Endeavour	Emeka Nebeife Page 2 March 12-18, 2018
67	Ugo touch of life foundation (U-TOLF)	U-TOLF takes medical outreach to Okpuje, Ugbene Ajima	Provision of medical treatment and empowerment to Okpuje and Ugbene ajima.	Nnaemeka Ikpe Page 8 March 12-18, 2018
68	Sports writers association of Nigeria	SWAN begins 2018 registration	Commencement of online swan membership registration for the year 2018	Francis Igata January 29-February 4, 2018
69	International press centre	IPC condemns attack on journalists	Condemnation of attacks on Anayo Onukwugha by a soldier on 1/11/218	Lizzy Achiagu Page 6 Nov 12-18, 2018
70	The association of radiologists of Nigeria (ARIN)	Association decries dearth of radiologists	Expression of concern over the shortage of radiologists in the health system	Chukwudi Nweke Page 16 Nov 12-18, 2018
71	National youth council of Nigeria	NYCN holds town hall meeting	Town hall meeting in all the 36 states of Nigeria aimed at finding a roadmap towards the 2019 elections.	Kris Chioke Page 2 October 22-28, 2018
72	Malaria No More	MNM promotes anti-malaria war	Sensitization on countries to buckle up to the battle against malaria	Chikodili Okey Page 6 May 15-21, 2017
73	Medical women association of Nigeria	Medical women association of Nigeria honor patron	A call and appeal to the general public to assist them to inform and persuade people to come for free cancer screening for early detection	Ifeoma Ogbu Page 3 May 8-14, 2017
74	PLAYIYA	Player trafficking high in Nigeria	PLAYIYA president, Lan Mengel said that football players trafficking was growing at an alarming rate in Nigeria and indeed Africa	Ifeoma Ogbu Page 3 May 8-14, 2017
75	Enugu state dynamic ambassadors group	Association holds prayer rally for Ugwuanyi, others	Prayer rally organization for gov. Ugwuanyi and other PDP candidates for 2019 elections	Mathias Nriji Page 2 November 28-Dec 2, 2018
76	National association of Nigeria traditional medicine practitioners	Enugu residents urged to use PVC's wisely	Support and canvass ion of votes for gov. Ugwuanyi	Ifeoma Ogbu Page 5 Nov-28-Dec 2, 218
77	Ancestral pride foundation (APF)	APF advocates traditional oath taking for public servants	Chief Fashola Faniyi advocates the swearing in of public officers through traditional oath	Dons Eze Page 18 Nov 28-Dec 2, 2018
78	Human Rights Watch	Rights group urges Angola to halt mass deportation	A call by the group to Angola to halt mass deportation of mostly Congolese people.	Chukwudi Nweke Page 17 Nov 19-25, 2018

Continued

79	Sports writers association of Nigeria (SWAN)	Enugu SWAN honors sports men, women	The association honors senator Ike Ekweremmadu, Nigeria brewery plc, Igwe Emmanuel Ugwu, Ejike Ikwu etc.	Eneja peace Page 2 December 21, 2015
80	Non-academic staff union of educational and associational institutions(NASUU)	NASUU ends 3-day national confab	Closure of the 6 th quadrennial national delegates conference of the union	Okeke Fidelis Page 20 December 21, 2015
81	The association of Nigeria premier league club chairmen and managers	SWAN, club owners hail Saraki on Ogba's appointment	Commendation of Senator Bukola Saraki on his decision to appoint Senator Obinna Ogba as chairman senate committee on sports	Norbert Okoli Page 21 December 21, 2015
82	Wash Media Network	Wash Media Network intensifies campaign	Campaign to create awareness to the people of Enugu state and advocate the role of safe water, improved hygiene and sanitation in wider human development in Nigeria	Simon Ugwuoke Page 9 October 9, 2015
83	Sports writers association of Nigeria (SWAN)	Police to partner SWAN in sports development	Indication of readiness by Enugu state police command to partner with SWAN in developing and promoting sports in the state	Nobert Okoli Page 21 October 7, 2015
84	Trade Union Congress (TUC)	TUC rejects increment of VAT to 10%	Condemnation of the move by the federal government to double value added tax from 5% to 10%.	Sylvester Ani Page 6 September 2, 2015
85	Sports writers association of Nigeria (SWAN)	SWAN honors Ubah	Honoring Dr Ifeanyi Ubah as the national patron of the association by SWAN	Cyril Ozor Page 23 September 2, 2015
86	Nigeria labor congress, trade union congress	NLC, TUC insists on living wage	A call on Gov. Ugwuanyi to urgently embark on the payment of the new minimum wage and its areas to Enugu workers	Nnaemeka Ikpe Page 13 July 27, 2015
87	Radio, television, theatre and arts workers union of Nigeria (RATTAWU)	RATTAWU week begins	Commencement of one week activities in Enugu state with a thanksgiving service at Holy spirit parish Golf estate	Emeka Ugwuoke Page 3 December 3-9, 2018
88	Water Aid Nigeria	Water aid organizes trainer's training	Participants training for implementation of San-Maria expansion and scale up/sustainable total sanitation project	Sebastine Okafor Page 3 December 3-9, 2018
89	YARADUA foundation	Foundation arrives Enugu south	Sensitization by the foundation on food security in Nigeria's changing climate	Anthonia Okafor Page 5 December 3-9, 2018
90	Nigeria union of teachers (NUT)	NUT lauds Isi-Uzor chairman	Payment of tribute to chairman of the local government for his performance since assumption of office	Emma Mbamalu Page 5 December 3-9, 2018
91	Sports writers association of Nigeria	SWAN president bags pillar of soccer award	Award of pillar of soccer by the Miss football Nigeria on 16 th December 2018 to honor Mr Sirawon	Francis Igata Page 23 December 17-23, 2018
92	Water sanitation and hygiene media network (WASH)	WASH media network visits Wateraid Nigeria	Commendation from the coordinator of wateraid Nigeria to WASH media network for its support in the area of publicity	Lizzy Achuagu Page 3 December 10-18, 2018

Continued

93	UNN ASUU	UNN ASUU sanctions members over convocation	Congress to be held to determine what to do with ASUU members that defiled the on-going nationwide strike to attend the 48 th convocation	Cyril Uzor Page 13 December 10-18, 2018
94	Association of Enugu state development unions (AESDA)	AESDA rallies support for Ugwuanyi	Support for Ugwuanyis candidacy and endorsement	Sylvester Ani Page 7 March 2, 2018
95	Sports writers association of Nigeria (SWAN)	Enugu SWAN felicitate with Rangers	Congratulatory message to Rangers for breaking a 32-year old jinx, Aruna Quadri on his latest feat by becoming the first African to be among the top 25 players in the world	Obert Okolie Page 31 November 1, 2016
96	Women Aid Collective (WACOL)	WACOL canvasses more elective posts for women	The executive director of the collective, Joy Ezeillocanvasses support for women in both elective and appointive positions in Enugu state	Lizzy Achuagu Page 8 May 29, 2016
97	Ohaneze Ndigbo youth council world wide	Igbo youths talk tough	Vow by igbo youths to resist any attempt by politicians to buy votes in the zone during the 2019 elections	Lizzy Achuagu Page 2 December 24-30, 2018
98	Tobi Okechukwu healthcare foundation	20,000 benefit from free medical outreach	Engagement of services of medical doctors resident in U.S.A for the treatment of people suffering from various ailments in Enugu west senatorial zone	Amechi Nwede Page 2 December 17-23, 2018
99	Old Artisan market traders association	Market leader recalls Ugwuanyi's achievement	A recollection of the achievements of Gov. Ugwuanyi by Chief Okechukwu peter Mbah.	Ekoh Uzoamaka Page 2 December 17-23, 2018
100	United Ufuoma fish farmers association	Farmers appeal to federal government over Anchor borrowers loan program	Request by John Ihesinaulo to the federal government to prevail on the CBN to remove middlemen in its Anchor borrowers loan program	Obert Okolie Page 22 February 13-19, 2017
101	Sports writers association of Nigeria (SWAN)	SWAN denies Obi clearance	Refusal of SWAN to endorse Mitchell Obi to re-contest for the AIPS Africa presidency	Obert Okoli Page 23 February 13-17, 2017
102	Christian association of Nigeria ; youth wing	CAN youths: we'll vote out APC in 2019	A vow by youth wing of CAN to vote out APC leaders working against Christians in the country	Will Jants Page 21 February 6-12, 2017
103	Police officers wives' association (POWA)	POWA visits Gov. Ugwuanyi	Commendation by Gov. Ugwuanyi to POWA for embarking on programs that would compliment government's effort.	Nnaemeka Ikpe Page 6 January 30, 2017
104	Sports writers association of Nigeria (SWAN)	SWAN partners police	A promise by police IG-Ibrahim Idris, to support SWAN in all its activities and efforts to enhance sports development	Obert Okoli Page 22 April 17-23, 2017
105	League management company (LMC)	LMC reassures referees	Shehu Dikko's restatement that safety and welfare of all persons at match venues counts high	Steve Landells Page 23 April 17-23, 2017
106	National union of food beverage tobacco company (NUFBTE)	NUFBTE honors Ugwuanyi	Conferment of merit award on Gov. Ugwuanyi in recognition of his exemplary leadership in office	Baldwin Amah Page 9 March 27-april 2, 2017

Continued

107	Nigeria association of women journalists (NAWOJ)	NAWOJ NEC meeting ends in Gombe	Plea by professor Ibrahim Hassan to educate the masses accurately	Chieso Aninwagu Page 10 March 27-April 2, 2017
108	Ogbete main market traders association (OMATA)	OMATA lauds traders empowerment scheme	Chief Steven Aniagu commending the state government for introducing monthly traders raffle draw in the state	Nneka Ahanonu Page 6 May 1-7, 2017
109	United Enugu state men and women for Gburugburu 2019	Another pro-Gburugburu group emerges-plans inauguration in the 17 LGA's	Maiden meeting of the group at Nkwo Nike, Enugu east local government after its inauguration recently	Oluchukwu Nnamani Page 9 May 1-7, 2017
110	The David Umahi Nweze Akubaraoha Ebonyi transformation agenda (DUNAETA)	GROUP HAILS Umahi for accepting to seek re-election	Expression of gratitude to Gov. Umahi for bowing to pressure to seek re-election during 2019 elections.	Emeka Ugwuoke Page 10 April 24-30, 2017
111	The international federation of women lawyers (FIDA)	FIDA shops for clinic, juvenile facilities	A call by the organization to assist them facilitate the building of rescue homes, correction centres and juvenile facilities to enable the organization rid Abia state of miscreants	Amechi Nwede Page 3 April 17-23, 2017
112	Osinachi age grade of Amankiri eke	Age grade plans support for members	A request by the chairman of the grade to members to present their cases of hardship, health issues etc. for assistance	Suleiman Onyeama Page 6 April 17-23, 2017
113	Nigeria union of allied health professionals	Health union denies strike plan	Explanation by the president of the union (Ben Asogwa) that his union had no plan to protest against the state government	Lizzy Achuagu Page 7 April 17-23, 2017