

# A Note on the (Faith-Menal) Counter Example

R. H. Sallam

Mathematics Department, Faculty of Science, Helwan University, Cairo, Egypt  
Email: rsallams@hotmail.com

Received September 1, 2011; revised October 15, 2011; accepted October 22, 2011

## ABSTRACT

Faith-Menal counter example is an example (unique) of a right John's ring which is not right Artinian. In this paper we show that the ring  $T$  which considered as an example of a right Johns ring in the (Faith-Menal) counter example is also Artinian. The conclusion is that the unique counter example that says a right John's ring can not be right Artinian is false and the right Noetherian ring with the annihilator property  $rl(A) = A$  may be Artinian.

**Keywords:** John's Ring; Artinian and Noetherian Rings

## 1. Introduction

A ring  $R$  is called right John's ring if it is right Noetherian and every right Ideal  $A$  of  $R$  is a right annihilator *i.e.*  $rl(A) = A$  for all right ideals  $A$  of  $R$ .

John's ([1], Theorem 1) by using a result of Kurshan ([2], Theorem 3.3), showed that a right Noetherian ring is right Artinian provided that every right ideal is a right annihilator.

Ginn [3] showed that Kurshan result was false. Ginn's example does not provide a counter example to John's theorem. Therefore the validity of John's theorem was doubtful.

Faith-Menal counter example proved that there is an example (unique) of a right John's ring which is not right Artinian.

Here in this paper we prove the false of the Faith-Menal counter example by proving that the considered non-Artinian right john's ring is in fact right Artinian. So the John's theorem may be true see [1].

All rings considered in this paper are associative rings with identity.

We recall the Faith-Menal counter example in Section 1 and we prove that it is false in Section 2.

## 2. Section 1: The Counter Example

Example 8.16 (Faith-Menal) [4]. Let  $D$  be any countable, extentionally closed division ring over a field  $F$ , and let  $R = D \otimes_F F(x)$ . Then  $T(R, D)$  is a non-Artinian right John's ring.

### Proof

Cohn shows that  $R$  is simple, principle right ideal domain that is right V ring (Theorems 8.4.5 & 5.5.5 [4]) and  $D$  is an  $R$ - $R$  bimodule such that  $D_R$  is the unique simple right  $R$  module. Hence  $T(R, D)$  is a right John's

ring by Theorem 8.15 (in this book). But  $T(R, D)$  is not Artinian because if it were then  $R$  would also right Artinian and hence a field which is a contradiction.

Here

$$T = R \oplus D \quad \text{and} \quad T/\langle 0, d \rangle \cong R$$

For more information about this example see [4].

## 3. Section 2: A Note on the Counter Example

### Theorem

The right John's ring  $T(R, D)$  defined in the counter example is Artinian.

### Proof

**Recall the following (Exercises 10.7 [5]):**

Let  $\varphi: D \rightarrow R$  be a ring homomorphism and let  $M$  be a right  $R$ -module (or left  $R$ -module) then

- 1) Via  $\varphi$   $M$  is right  $D$ -module;
- 2) If  $M_D$  is Artinian or Noetherian then so is  $M_R$ ;
- 3) If  $R$  is finite dimensional algebra (via  $\varphi$ ) over a field

$D$  then the following is equivalent:

- a)  $M_R$  is Artinian and Noetherian
- b)  $M_R$  is finitely generated
- c)  $M_D$  is finite dimension

1) Consider the ring homomorphism  $\varphi: D \rightarrow R$  defined by  $\varphi(d) = d \otimes 1_f$ . Every  $R$ -module homomorphism is a  $D$ -homomorphism via  $\varphi$ . Since  $D$  is a division ring so it will be semisimple ring and hence every right  $D$ -module is semisimple (Corollary 8.2.2 [3]).

2) If the ring  $T = R \oplus D$  is John's ring (as in the counter example above) then it is Noetherian and hence  $R$  and  $D$  are Noetherian. As  $D$  is right Noetherian ring then every finitely generated right  $D$  module is Noetherian (6.1.3 [6]).

3) Every finitely generated right  $D$ -module  $M$  is semisimple so it is right Artinian.

4) Since every finitely generated right D-module  $M$  is Artinian and Noetherian then  $M$  is Artinian and Noetherian as an  $R$ -module.

5) Now since  $R$  is simple principle ideal domain then  $R$  is a finite dimensional  $k$ -algebra where  $k$  is a subring of the center of  $R$  with identity  $1_R$  and hence  $R$  is a finite dimensional algebra over the field  $Z(D)$  the center of  $D$ .

Applying the above equivalence we get that every finitely generated right  $R$ -module is Artinian and hence  $R$  is right Artinian and this imply that  $T$  is also Artinian.

#### 4. Conclusion

The conclusion is that the unique example that says a right John's ring can not be right Artinian is false.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] B. Johns, "Annihilator Conditions in Noetherian Rings," *Journal of Algebra*, Vol. 49, No. 1, 1977, pp. 222-224. [doi:10.1016/0021-8693\(77\)90282-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/0021-8693(77)90282-4)
- [2] R. P. Kurshan, "Rings Whose Cyclic Modules Have Finitely Generated Socle," *Journal of Algebra*, Vol. 15, No. 3, 1970, pp. 376-386. [doi:10.1016/0021-8693\(70\)90066-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/0021-8693(70)90066-9)
- [3] S. M. Ginn, "A Counter Example to a Theorem of Kurshan," *Journal of Algebra*, Vol. 40, No. 1, 1976, pp. 105-106. [doi:10.1016/0021-8693\(76\)90090-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/0021-8693(76)90090-9)
- [4] W. K. Nicholson and M. F. Yousif, "Quasi-Frobenius Rings," *Series Cambridge Tracts in Mathematics*, No. 158, 2003.
- [5] F. W. Anderson and K. R. Fuller, "Rings and Categories of Module," Springer Verlag, New York, 1991.
- [6] F. Kasch, "Modules and Rings, London Mathematical Society Monographs," Vol. 17, Academic Press, New York, 1982.
- [1] B. Johns, "Annihilator Conditions in Noetherian Rings,"