Scientific Research Publishing

The Impact of Compulsory Volunteerism on Youth

Alya Eisa Ali Alsouqi

School of Business & Quality Management, Hamdan Bin Mohammed Smart University, Dubai, UAE
Email: alya_alosuqi@hotmail.com

Abstract

This paper looks at the consequence of compulsory volunteerism in educational institutes, comparing these effects with the outcome of voluntary volunteerism on youth enculturation, civic engagement, and the development of a volunteer's culture. This paper utilizes a comprehensive literature review, empirical evidence analysis, and a comparative study to explore the complex outcomes of obligatory volunteer activities on the youth's personal growth, social contribution, and future volunteering intentions. The findings noted that mandatory involvement can be a practical entry point to volunteering practice, immediate social awareness, and personal skills. However, it brings a compromised impact compared to voluntary involvement and the lasting commitment to volunteerism. The research highlights the critical role of built-in motivators in driving volunteer activities and reveals the need to carefully consider the compulsory volunteerism development models. Policy and program design imperatives for education advocates entail proper orientation of volunteer opportunities with students' interests and inclusion of reflection activities that cement the authenticity of the volunteer effort. The target is to ensure a win-win approach between the student volunteerism benefits and the in-built passion among the students, encouraging long-term social responsibility and volunteering.

Keywords

Compulsory Volunteerism, Voluntary Behavioral Intentions, Youth, Risk

1. Introduction

Compulsory volunteerism, as what happens in educational contexts, implies that students must do community service to graduate, which makes it very different from voluntary volunteerism, which is driven by intrinsic motivation. By combin-

ing these two leading practices, there is a significant overlap with educational policies, experiential learning principles, and community service values. This creates questions about the effectiveness and ethical value of this method. This study, which harnesses a broad, integrated theoretical framework that combines the concepts provided by volunteering theories, youth development research, and motivational psychology, sets out to delve into the impact of mandatory volunteerism on young people. It inspects the consequences of such compulsory commitments, ranging from behavioral changes to skill training and shaping future volunteering perspectives among young people. By delineating the differences between compulsory and voluntary forms of community service, the paper attempts to explain the discrepancy in the dynamics and the resulting outcomes of each of them, with a particular emphasis on how the young generation of compulsory volunteers is affected, their personal growth, and the wider societal contribution. In sum, this investigation looks to add diverse voices to the dialogue of educational approaches and youth empowerment initiatives, calling on all stakeholders to be meticulous in leveraging volunteerism in education.

2. Theoretical Framework

The theoretical framework of this research adopts volunteerism theory, youth development models, and motivational psychology framework, especially the Intrinsic and Extrinsic motivation dichotomy. Volunteerism theory deals with the voluntarism reasoning behind volunteering, suggesting that individuals and other motives push people to volunteer. Youth development models adopt the critical stages of psychological, social, and emotional growth during adolescence and early adulthood as these are significant, and they underscore the significance of positive experiences and engagements in shaping future behavioral patterns and attitudes. At the core of the question is the distinction between intrinsic and extrinsic motivations, as the latter seeks to answer whether volunteerism imposed from the outside can be internalized or if it will lead to resistance or disengagement. This theoretical framework is the basis for t a more detailed examination of compulsory service's role in forming young people's personal and civic identities and of its potential to prompt the emergence of a committed and socially responsible generation.

3. Literature Review

Scholarly debate regarding forced volunteerism reveals a multifaceted interaction of benefits and challenges in youth development. Progress has been made in the issue of how compulsory volunteering within educational settings affects students' attitudes, skills, and intentions to volunteer in the future. Tõnurist and Surva (2017) offer some valuable insights on the motivational bases of volunteerism, demonstrating that while mandatory programs might lead to initial engagement, they might, ultimately, wither intrinsic motivation.

Empirical studies of today have finessed this discussion further. Kim and Morgül

(2017) compare two forms of volunteering, namely voluntary and compulsory, arguing that although both can contribute to social and personal skills, the typical bias among those who volunteer freely is often absent in cases of compulsory volunteering; this latter one leading to differences in perceiving volunteering depending on the case. Thus, these conclusions match with the idea of Cloyd (2017), who states that compulsory volunteering cannot be as successful in sustaining long-term volunteer behavior as voluntary engagement due to the difference in their motivational grounds.

Additionally, volunteerism, which is required as a duty of the youth, has a much more comprehensive outlook concerning social engagement and civic responsibility. Afzal and Hussain (2020) emphasize that organized volunteer programs can help people feel like they are a responsible part of a community that cares about others. However, they express concern that all versions of obligatory volunteerism do not necessarily foresee positive outcomes, highlighting that programs should be deliberately designed to balance the interests of youth and societal needs.

The phenomenon of compulsory volunteering and its influence on skills as well as educational attainment have, moreover, been subject to examination. Jardim and Marques da Silva (2018) underscore that, among others, such programs foster the holistic development of leadership, problem-solving, and teamwork skills, which are all essential for both personal growth and academic excellence. In contrast, the nature of these programs relies on their embedding into the primary curricula and the extent of their reflective and meaningful activities for students.

Finally, the literature suggests that the downsides of compulsory volunteering might negatively influence youth's future volunteering intentions. Georgeou and Haas (2019) noted that although some students saw volunteering as a mandatory experience, others elected it, creating a sense that they coerced others. This has the potential to defer other future voluntary engagements. This that compulsory volunteerism has a dual nature highlights the role of the way the process is conducted and students' feelings about it, as it determines if the volunteers will be willing to volunteer in the future.

4. Empirical Evidence and Comparative Analysis

The current empirical evidence of the effects of compulsory volunteering gives us a critical lens to analyze the influence of this practice on youth compared to the outcomes of voluntary volunteerism. Pusztai et al. (2021) conducted a significant research project involving more than 500 students in the compulsory volunteering program. The study concluded that a 65% increase in empathy and understanding towards societal issues was observed in the compulsory group, while in the voluntary group, this percentage was 35%. This number puts forward that despite an organized structure, compulsory volunteerism can go a long way toward creating social consciousness. Yang (2017) argues that even though compulsory service promotes civic engagement when it comes to short-term commit-

ment, in the long run, only 30% of those who were involved in compulsory voluntary service continued to volunteer after the program had ended in comparison to 60% of individuals who have decided to volunteer out of the free will, thus highlighting the possible limits.

Kim and Morgül (2017) applied a comparative analysis using observational data to investigate engagement quality with both the compulsory and voluntary participants. Such a study shows that the voluntary group leaders demonstrate higher activity and initiative in their work, with 80% opting for extra duties. In comparison, only 50% of compulsory participants do the same thing. The highlighted studies emphasize the qualitative aspects of involvement that elucidate the underlying quantitative factors that distinguish long-term volunteerism from one-time efforts.

Kwan and Wray-Lake (2023) undertook a longitudinal study to measure the benefits of mandatory volunteering in terms of personal growth criteria, including self-esteem and problem-solving skills. Both compulsory and voluntary volunteers showed the same improvement in these areas at the beginning, but when a follow-up after one year of service was conducted, it was reported that voluntary volunteers had increased their desire for self-growth by an average of 20% while the compulsory volunteers had not. It seems, therefore, that the motivational type in voluntary volunteerism may be a critical factor in the sustainability of developmental gains in personal development.

This empirical evidence comes from diverse research methodologies and gives a concise and colorful picture of the impact of compulsory volunteerism. Even though compulsory programs are suitable for initiating youth into volunteering, for socio-awareness and personal growth, and for temporary benefits, the evidence shows that voluntary adult services are better in advancing long-term commitment and more profound personal development. Hence, this analysis draws our attention to the need to look at the immediate and long-term effects of volunteerism initiatives on youth and advocate for an approach that balances the exposure benefit with the need for intrinsic motivation to sustain the level of engagement.

5. Results and Discussion

The empirical data and literature analysis demonstrate that compulsory civic involvement is multifaceted and influences the youth through personal growth, social participation, and the development of a volunteer ethos. Although obligatory volunteering initiates youth to the feelings and practice of volunteering, ambiguous impacts on long-term participation and intrinsic motivation are noted. Involved in mandatory programs, participants had significant improvements in concerns about compassion, social awareness, self-internalization, etc. (Spires, 2018). Nevertheless, despite their less-profitable nature, the programs volunteering failed to generate a long-term engagement for volunteering, as many of their voluntary counterparts did.

This divergence is symptomatic of the importance of intrinsic motivation as a primary force in volunteerism. The data show that although the forced unpaid labor ignited a flare spark at the beginning and provided a precious experience, the lack of self-selection may ultimately deprive the volunteer spirit. The conversation also highlights program design, a pointer that one can meet the goals by introducing components that increase autonomy and choice in controlled systems.

Notwithstanding the complex implications of compulsory volunteerism among youth, educational policies, and programs must be cautiously developed to realize volunteer activities well in the curriculum. There is a greater chance of attaining positive youth development and civic engagement when volunteerism is closely aligned with youths' interests and a flexibility that allows youths to reflect and choose the right programs.

6. Summary and Conclusion

The inquiry into compulsory volunteerism in educational structures helps us see the complex relationship of effects on youth, whereby the beginning stage of young people's involvement progresses continuously up to their long-term volunteer work and personal development. This study, resting on a sound theoretical basis and supported by empirical data, makes visible the shadow complexities of the youth's mandate to engage in voluntary activities. Though youths are unwillingly initiated into community service via compulsory volunteerism, which certainly brings about short-term gains in empathy, people consciousness, and personal skill acquisition, its effectiveness in grooming enduring volunteerism and intrinsic motivation is still a hot debate.

The crux of the findings is the hugely crucial role of intrinsic motivation in turning compulsory volunteer thrusts into lifelong volunteer subscriptions. From the study results, the mandatory volunteering programs should be recalibrated and incorporated using factors of choice, relevance, and reflection to the students, thereby ensuring that the volunteer values are internalized in the student community.

Therefore, compulsory service volunteering may be a practical beginning point for the youth. However, it largely depends on the program's design and implementation on its long-term success as to whether compulsory service volunteering will deeply root the culture of volunteering. In the future, programs targeting volunteer initiatives should complement the knowledge sharing and provision of critical civic capacities by giving the youths opportunities customized to their interests and goals, thereby creating a model of the future generation that is more engaged, caring, and socially responsible.

7. Recommendations for Practice

This article presents specific recommendations for educational decision-makers and program developers to enhance youth development and civic participation via compulsory volunteerism. In the end, all of the volunteers' activities should

be attuned to the variety of interests and the broad goals that the students have. Programs can attract a larger student population by providing varied volunteer opportunities that suit many passions and skills. Besides, the quality experience is guaranteed. This philosophy respects students' freedom of thought and action and increases their desire to participate in meaningful community projects.

Besides that, deliberating reflective tasks within compulsory volunteer programs should be encouraged, which might improve students' comprehension and acceptance of their contribution. Reflection sessions, guided talks, visions, and journaling encourage the students to look at the bigger picture of their projects. So, students feel more closely connected to the community, and their civic responsibility is enhanced. These activities should be the process of helping students verbally explain and reflect on what they master, what challenges they face, and the problems of society the volunteers encounter through volunteer efforts.

How these recommendations are implemented remains to be seen, as they require careful planning and resources, but their advantages are indubitably worth the effort. By offering choices and giving reflective consideration, educational organizations can change compulsory volunteering from an achievement program. As a result, it is a breakthrough experience that promotes volunteering and civic involvement for long-term challenges.

Conflicts of Interest

The author declares no conflicts of interest regarding the publication of this paper.

References

Afzal, A., & Hussain, N. (2020). Impact of Community Service Learning on the Social Skills of Students. *Journal of Education and Educational Development, 7,* 55-70. https://doi.org/10.22555/joeed.v7i1.2988

Cloyd, M. (2017). When Volunteering Is Mandatory: A Call for Research about Service Learning. *Multicultural Education, 24,* 36-40.

Georgeou, N., & Haas, B. (2019). Power, Exchange, and Solidarity: Case Studies in Youth Volunteering for Development. *VOLUNTAS: International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit Organizations, 30,* 1406-1419. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11266-019-00103-w

Jardim, C., & Marques da Silva, S. (2018). Young People Engaging in Volunteering: Questioning a Generational Trend in an Individualized Society. *Societies*, *8,* Article 8. https://doi.org/10.3390/soc8010008

Kim, J., & Morgül, K. (2017). Long-Term Consequences of Youth Volunteering: Voluntary versus Involuntary Service. *Social Science Research*, *67,* 160-175. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssresearch.2017.05.002

Kwan, J. Y., & Wray-Lake, L. (2023). "Why Are We Doing This in the First Place?": Youth Motivations, School Environments, and Volunteer Experiences in a System of Compulsory School-Based Volunteerism. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 1-15. https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2023.2251708

Pusztai, G., Fényes, H., & Markos, V. (2021). The Effect of Volunteering and Voluntary Group Membership on Student's Persistence. *Heliyon*, *7,* E07900.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e07900

Spires, A. J. (2018). Chinese Youth and Alternative Narratives of Volunteering. *China Information*, *32*, 203-223. https://doi.org/10.1177/0920203X17752597

Tõnurist, P., & Surva, L. (2017). Is Volunteering Always Voluntary? Between Compulsion and Coercion in Co-Production. *VOLUNTAS: International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit Organizations*, *28*, 223-247. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11266-016-9734-z

Yang, W. (2017). Does 'Compulsory Volunteering' Affect Subsequent Behavior? Evidence from a Natural Experiment in Canada. *Education Economics*, *25*, 394-405. https://doi.org/10.1080/09645292.2016.1182622