

Inverse Problems on Critical Number in Finite Groups

Qinghong Wang¹, Jujuan Zhuang²

¹College of Science, Tianjin University of Technology, Tianjin, China

²Department of Mathematics, Dalian Maritime University, Dalian, China

Email: wqh1208@yahoo.com.cn, jjzhuang1979@yahoo.com.cn

Received February 28, 2013; revised March 28, 2013; accepted April 20, 2013

Copyright © 2013 Qinghong Wang, Jujuan Zhuang. This is an open access article distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

ABSTRACT

Let G be a finite nilpotent group of odd order and S be a subset of $G \setminus \{0\}$. We say that S is **complete** if every element of G can be represented as a sum of different elements of S and **incomplete** otherwise. In this paper, we obtain the characterization of large incomplete sets.

Keywords: Critical Number; Incomplete Set; Finite Nilpotent Group

1. Introduction

Let G be a finite additively written group (not necessarily commutative). Let $S = \{a_1, \dots, a_k\}$ be a subset of $G \setminus \{0\}$. Define $\Sigma(S) = \{a_{i_1} + \dots + a_{i_l} \mid i_1, \dots, i_l \text{ are distinct } 1 \leq l \leq k\}$. For technical reasons we define $\Sigma_0(S) = \Sigma(S) \cup \{0\}$. We call S an **additive basis** of G if $\Sigma(S) = G$. The critical number $\text{cr}(G)$ of G is the smallest integer t such that every subset S of $G \setminus \{0\}$ with $|S| \geq t$ forms an additive basis of G . $\text{cr}(G)$ was first introduced and studied by Erdős and Heilbronn in 1964 [1] for $G = \mathbb{Z}_p$ where p is a prime. This parameter has been studied for a long time and its exact value is known for a large number of groups (see [2-10]).

Following Erdős [1], we say that S is **complete** if $\Sigma(S) = G$ and **incomplete** otherwise.

In this paper, we would like to study the following question: What is the structure of a relatively large incomplete set? Technically speaking, we would like to have a characterization for incomplete sets of relatively large size. Such a characterization has been obtained recently for finite abelian groups (see [11-13]). In this paper, we shall prove the following result.

Theorem 1.1. Let G be a finite nilpotent group with order $n = ph$, where $p \geq 5$ is the smallest prime dividing n . Also assume that h is composite and $h \geq 7p + 3$. Let S be a subset of $G \setminus \{0\}$ such that $|S| = h + p - 3$. If S is incomplete, then there exist a subgroup H of order h and $g \notin H$ such that $(H \setminus \{0\}) \subseteq S$ and $S \subseteq H \cup (g + H) \cup (-g + H)$.

2. Notations and Tools

If S be a subset of the group G , we shall denote by $|S|$ the cardinality of S , by $\langle S \rangle$ the subgroup generated by S . If A_1, \dots, A_n are subsets of G , let $A_1 + \dots + A_n$ denote the set of all sums $a_1 + \dots + a_n$, where $a_i \in A_i$. Recall the following well known result obtained by Cauchy and Davenport.

Lemma 2.1. Let p be a prime number. Let X and Y be non-empty subsets of \mathbb{Z}_p . Then

$$|X + Y| \geq \min\{p, |X| + |Y| - 1\}.$$

We also use the following well known result.

Lemma 2.2 [14]. Let G be a finite group. Let X and Y be subsets of G such that $X + Y \neq G$. Then

$$|X| + |Y| \leq |G|.$$

Lemma 2.3 [3]. Let G be a cyclic group of order pq , where p, q are primes. Then

$$p + q - 2 \leq \text{cr}(G) \leq p + q - 1.$$

Lemma 2.4 [8]. Let G be a non-abelian group of order $pq \geq 10$, where p, q are distinct primes. Then $\text{cr}(G) = p + q - 2$.

Lemma 2.5 [10]. Let G be a finite nilpotent group of odd order and let p be the smallest prime dividing $|G|$. If $|G|/p$ is a composite number then $\text{cr}(G) = |G|/p + p - 2$.

Lemma 2.6. Let G be a finite nilpotent group of odd order and let p be the smallest prime dividing $|G|$. If $|S| = |G|/p + p - 1$ then $\Sigma(S) = G$.

Proof. Obviously, this follows from Lemmas 2.3-2.5.

Lemma 2.7 [15]. Let S be a subset of a finite group G of order n . If $|S| \geq 3\sqrt{n}$ then $0 \in \Sigma(S)$.

Lemma 2.8 [16]. Let G be a noncyclic group. Let S be a subset $G \setminus \{0\}$. Then $|\Sigma_0(S)| \geq \min\{|G|-1, 2|S|\}$.

Let $B \subseteq G$ and $x \in G$. As usual, we write

$\lambda_B(x) = |(B+x) \setminus B|$. We have the following result obtained by Olson.

Lemma 2.9 [5]. Let S be a nonempty subset of $G \setminus \{0\}$ and $y \in S$. Let $B = \Sigma(S)$. Then

$$|\Sigma_0(S)| \geq |\Sigma_0(S \setminus y)| + \lambda_B(y).$$

We shall also use the following result of Olson.

Lemma 2.10. Let G be a finite group and let S be a generating subset of G such that $0 \notin S$. Let B be a subset of G such that $|B| \leq |G|/2$. Then there is $x \in S$ such that

$$\lambda_B(x) \geq \min\left\{\frac{|B|+1}{2}, \frac{|S \cup -S|+2}{4}\right\}.$$

This result follows by applying Lemma 3.1 of [15] to $S \cup -S$. Let x be a subset of G with cardinality k . Let $\{x_1, \dots, x_k\}$ be an ordering of X . For $0 \leq i \leq k$, set $X_i = \{x_j \mid 1 \leq j \leq i\}$ and $B_i = \Sigma_0(X_i)$.

The ordering $\{x_1, \dots, x_k\}$ is called a **resolving sequence** of X if, for each $i = 1, \dots, k$, $\lambda_{B_i}(x_i) = \max\{\lambda_{B_j}(x_j) \mid 1 \leq j \leq i\}$.

The **critical index** of the resolving sequence is the largest $t \in [1, k+1]$ such that X_{t-1} generates a proper subgroup of G . Clearly, every nonempty subsets S has a resolving sequence.

We need the following basic property of resolving sequence which is implicit in [5].

Lemma 2.11. Let X be a generating subset of a finite group G such that

$$X \cap -X = \emptyset \text{ and } 2|\Sigma_0(X)| \leq |G|.$$

Let the ordering $\{x_1, \dots, x_k\}$ be a resolving sequence of X with critical index t . Then, there is a subset $V \subset X$ such that $|V| = t-1, \langle V \rangle \neq G$ and

$$|\Sigma_0(X)| \geq 4|V| + \frac{(|X| + |V| + 5)(|X| - |V| - 1) - 2}{4}.$$

Proof. This is essentially formula (4) of [5]. By Lemma 2.9 we have

$$|\Sigma_0(X)| \geq \lambda_{B_k}(x_k) + \dots + \lambda_{B_{t+1}}(x_{t+1}) + |B_t|.$$

By Lemma 2.10 we have $\lambda_{B_i}(x_i) \geq \left\lceil \frac{i+1}{2} \right\rceil$ for each $i \geq t$. On the other hand, by Lemma 2.8 we have $|B_{t-1}| \geq 2(t-1)$. By the definition of t , we have $|B_t| \geq |B_{t-1}| + |x_t + B_{t-1}| = 2|B_{t-1}| \geq 4(t-1)$. By taking

$V = X_{t-1}$, we have the claimed inequality.

Lemma 2.12. Let G be a finite group with order $n = ph$, where $p \geq 5$ is the smallest prime dividing n and $h \geq 7p+3$. Let S be a subset of $G \setminus \{0\}$ such that $|S| = h+p-3$ and $\Sigma(S) \neq G$. Then there exists a set $X \subset S$ such that $|X| = (|S|-1)/2, X \cap -X = \emptyset$ and $2|\Sigma_0(X)| + \frac{|S|-1}{4} + 1 \leq n$.

Proof. Since $h \geq 7p+3$ and p is the smallest prime dividing n , we have $|S|^2 > 9ph$. By Lemma 2.7, $\Sigma(S) = \Sigma_0(S)$.

Clearly, we may partition $S = U \cup V$ such that $|U| = |V|-1$ and $U \cap -U = V \cap -V = \emptyset$.

We consider two cases.

Case 1. $|\Sigma(V)| \leq \frac{n}{2}$.

Set $C = \Sigma_0(V)$. By Lemma 2.10, there is $y \in V$ such that

$$\lambda_C(y) \geq \frac{|S|-1}{4} + 1.$$

It follows $|\Sigma_0(V)| \geq |\Sigma_0(V \setminus \{y\})| + \frac{|S|-1}{4} + 1$ by

Lemma 2.9.

Since $G \neq \Sigma_0(S) \supseteq \Sigma_0(U) + \Sigma_0(V)$ we have, by Lemma 2.2,

$$|\Sigma_0(U)| + |\Sigma_0(V \setminus \{y\})| + \frac{|S|-1}{4} + 1 \leq n.$$

Case 2. $|\Sigma_0(V)| > \frac{n}{2}$.

By Lemma 2.2, $|\Sigma_0(U)| \leq \frac{n}{2}$. Put $E = \Sigma_0(U)$. By Lemma 2.10, there is $y \in V$, such that

$$\lambda_E(y) \geq \frac{|S|-1}{4} + 1.$$

Therefore,

$$|\Sigma_0(U \cup \{y\})| \geq |\Sigma_0(U)| + \lambda_E(y) \geq +1 + \frac{|S|-1}{4}.$$

By Lemma 2.2,

$G \neq \Sigma_0(S) \supseteq \Sigma_0(U \cup \{y\}) + \Sigma_0(V \setminus \{y\})$ implies

$$|\Sigma_0(U)| + |\Sigma_0(V \setminus \{y\})| + \frac{|S|-1}{4} + 1 \leq n.$$

In both cases, one of the sets $U, V \setminus \{y\}$ verifies the conclusion of the lemma. This completes the proof.

Lemma 2.13. Let $k = \frac{n+p^2}{2p} - 2$, where p is the smallest prime dividing n . If

$$8v - n + \frac{(k+v+5)(k-v-1)+k}{2} \leq 0$$

and $n > 7p^2$, then $v > \frac{n}{p^2} + p - 2$.

Proof. Set

$$\begin{aligned} F(v, n) &= 8v - n + \frac{(k+v+5)(k-v-1)+k}{2} \\ &= \frac{1}{2}(k^2 + 5k - 2n - v^2 + 10v - 5) \end{aligned}$$

and $G(n) = F\left(\frac{n}{p^2} + p - 2, n\right)$.

First, let us show that $v \geq 5$. Assume the contrary that $0 \leq v \leq 4$. We have

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial n} F(v, n) = \frac{n - 3p^2 + p}{4p^2} > 0.$$

Since $n > 7p^2$, we have

$$F(v, n) \geq F(0, n) \geq F(0, 7p^2) = p^2 + 2p - \frac{11}{2} > 0,$$

a contradiction to $F(v, n) \leq 0$.

Second, let us show that $v > \frac{n}{p^2} + p - 2$.

Assume the contrary. Since $v \geq 5$,

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial v} F(v, n) = 5 - v \leq 0, \text{ we have}$$

1) $G(n) \leq F(v, n) \leq 0$.

On the other hand, since $n \geq 7p^2$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} 4p^4 G'(n) &= n(p^2 - 4) - p^2(3p^2 + 3p - 28) \\ &\geq p^3(4p - 3) > 0 \end{aligned}$$

$$\text{Then, } G(n) \geq G(7p^2) = \frac{1}{2}(p^2 + 4p + 14) > 0,$$

A contradiction to (1). Therefore, we have

$$v > \frac{n}{p^2} + p - 2. \text{ This completes the proof.}$$

Lemma 2.14. Let G be a finite group with order n . Let H be a proper subgroup of G and S a subset of $G \setminus \{0\}$. If $\Sigma_0(S \setminus H) + H \neq G$ and $|G|/|H|$ is a prime, then $|S \setminus H| \leq \frac{|G|}{|H|} - 2$.

Moreover, if $|S \setminus H| = \frac{|G|}{|H|} - 2 > 0$ then there is

$$g \notin H \text{ such that } S \subseteq H \cup (g + H) \cup (-g + H).$$

Proof. By \bar{x} we shall mean $\phi(x)$, where $G \rightarrow G/H$ is the canonical morphism. Put $S \setminus H = \{a_1, \dots, a_j\}$.

From our assumption we have $\Sigma_0(\overline{S \setminus H}) \neq G/H$.

By Lemma 2.1, we have

$$|\Sigma_0(\overline{S \setminus H})| = |\{0, \bar{a}_1\} + \dots + \{0, \bar{a}_j\}| \geq (j, j+1).$$

It follows that $j \leq q - 2$.

Assume now $j = q - 2$. If there is i such that $\bar{a}_i \notin \{\bar{a}_1, -\bar{a}_1\}$, say $i = 2$, then $|\{0, \bar{a}_1\} + \{0, \bar{a}_2\}| = 4$.

By Lemma 2.1, we have

$$|\{0, \bar{a}_1\} + \dots + \{0, \bar{a}_{q-2}\}| \geq 3 + \min(q, q-3) = q,$$

a contradiction to $\Sigma_0(S \setminus H) + H \neq G$. Then there is $g \notin H$ such that

$$S \subseteq H \cup (g + H) \cup (-g + H).$$

3. Proof of Theorem 1.1

Proof. By Lemma 2.12 there exists a set $X \subset S$ such that $|X| = (|S| - 1)/2$, $X \cap -X = \emptyset$ and

$$2|\Sigma_0(X)| + \frac{|S| - 1}{4} + 1 \leq n. \tag{2}$$

We have

$$|\langle X \rangle| \geq |X \cup -X \cup \{0\}| = \frac{n}{p} + p - 3.$$

Therefore X generates G .

By Lemma 2.11, there is $V \subset X$ such that $\langle V \rangle \neq G$ verifying

$$|\Sigma_0(X)| \geq 4|V| + \frac{(|X| + |V| + 5)(|X| - |V| - 1) - 2}{4}. \tag{3}$$

Let H be the subgroup generated by V and let p' be the smallest prime dividing $|H|$.

Put $v = |V|$, $k = \frac{n + p^2}{2p} - 2$. Set

$$F(v, n) = 8v - n + \frac{(k+v+5)(k-v-1)+k}{2}.$$

By (2) and (3), we have $F(v, n) \leq 0$.

By Lemma 2.13, we have

$$|V| > \frac{n}{p^2} + p - 2 \geq \frac{n}{pp'} + p' - 2.$$

By Lemma 2.6, we get $\Sigma_0(V) = H$.

Since $|H| > \frac{n}{p^2}$, we see easily that $q = \frac{|G|}{|H|}$ is a

prime. Since S is incomplete, we have

$$G \neq \Sigma_0(V) + \Sigma_0(S \setminus H) = H + \Sigma_0(S \setminus H). \text{ By Lemma 2.14, } |S \setminus H| \leq q - 2.$$

We have

$$\frac{n}{q} = |H| \geq |S \cap H| + 1 \geq \frac{n}{p} + p - 3 - (q - 2) + 1 = \frac{n}{p} + p - q,$$

which implies $p = q$ and $\frac{n}{p} = |H| = |S \cap H| + 1$. Hence,

$|S \setminus H| = p - 2$. By Lemma 2.14, there exist a subgroup H of order h and $g \notin H$ such that

$$(H \setminus \{0\}) \subseteq S \text{ and } S \subseteq H \cup (g + H) \cup (-g + H).$$

4. Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank the referee for his/her very useful suggestions. This work has been supported by the National Science Foundation of China with grant No. 11226279 and 11001035.

REFERENCES

- [1] P. Erdős and H. Heibronn, "On the Addition of Residue Classes Mod p ," *Acta Arithmetica*, Vol. 9, 1964, pp. 149-159.
- [2] J. A. Dias da Silva and Y. O. Hamidoune, "Cyclic Spaces for Grassmann Derivatives and Additive Theory," *Bulletin London Mathematical Society*, Vol. 26, No. 2, 1994, pp. 140-146. [doi:10.1112/blms/26.2.140](https://doi.org/10.1112/blms/26.2.140)
- [3] G. T. Diderrich, "An Addition Theorem for Abelian Groups of Order pq ," *Journal of Number Theory*, Vol. 7, No. 1, 1975, pp. 33-48. [doi:10.1016/0022-314X\(75\)90006-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/0022-314X(75)90006-2)
- [4] J. E. Olson, "An Addition Theorem Mod p ," *Journal of Combinatorial Theory*, Vol. 5, No. 1, 1968, pp. 45-52. [doi:10.1016/S0021-9800\(68\)80027-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0021-9800(68)80027-4)
- [5] W. Gao and Y. O. Hamidoune, "On Additive Bases," *Acta Arithmetica*, Vol. 88, 1999, pp. 233-237.
- [6] H. B. Mann and Y. F. Wou, "An Addition Theorem for the Elementary Abelian Group of Type (p,p) ," *Monatshefte für Mathematik*, Vol. 102, No. 4, 1986, pp. 273-308. [doi:10.1007/BF01304301](https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01304301)
- [7] M. Freeze, W. D. Gao and A. Geroldinger, "The Critical Number of Finite Abelian Groups," *Journal of Number Theory*, Vol. 129, No. 11, 2009, pp. 2766-2777. [doi:10.1016/j.jnt.2009.05.016](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jnt.2009.05.016)
- [8] Q. H. Wang and J. J. Zhuang, "On the Critical Number of Finite Groups of Order pq ," *International Journal of Number Theory*, Vol. 8, No. 5, 2012, pp. 1271-1280. [doi:10.1142/S1793042112500741](https://doi.org/10.1142/S1793042112500741)
- [9] J. R. Griggs, "Spanning Subset Sums for Finite Abelian Groups," *Discrete Mathematics*, Vol. 229, No. 1-3, 2001, pp. 89-99. [doi:10.1016/S0012-365X\(00\)00203-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0012-365X(00)00203-X)
- [10] Q. H. Wang and Y. K. Qu, "On the Critical Number of Finite Groups (II)," *Ars Combinatoria*, Accepted for Publication in December 2009, to Appear.
- [11] W. Gao, Y. O. Hamidoune, A. Llad and O. Serra, "Covering a Finite Abelian Group by Subset Sums," *Combinatorica*, Vol. 23, No. 4, 2003, pp. 599-611. [doi:10.1007/s00493-003-0036-x](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00493-003-0036-x)
- [12] V. H. Vu, "Structure of Large Incomplete Sets in Finite Abelian Groups," *Combinatorica*, Vol. 30, No. 2, 2010, pp. 225-237. [doi:10.1007/s00493-010-2336-2](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00493-010-2336-2)
- [13] D. Guo, Y. K. Qu, G. Q. Wang and Q. H. Wang, "Extremal Incomplete Sets in Finite Abelian Groups," *Ars Combinatoria*, Accepted for Publication in December 2011, to Appear.
- [14] H. B. Mann, "Addition Theorems," 2nd Edition, R. E. Krieger, New York, 1976.
- [15] J. E. Olson, "Sum of Sets of Group Elements," *Acta Arithmetica*, Vol. 28, No. 76, 1975, pp. 147-156.
- [16] Y. O. Hamidoune, "Adding Distinct Congruence Classes," *Combinatorics, Probability and Computing*, Vol. 7, No. 1, 1998, pp. 81-87. [doi:10.1017/S0963548397003180](https://doi.org/10.1017/S0963548397003180)