

Policies on Employment-Linked Vocational Training for Workers in Ha Tinh Province: Current Situtation and Solutions

Quang Thang Dao

Department of Academic Affairs, Vinh University, Vinh, Vietnam Email: daoquangthang@vinhuni.edu.vn

How to cite this paper: Dao, Q. T. (2025). Policies on Employment-Linked Vocational Training for Workers in Ha Tinh Province: Current Situtation and Solutions. American Journal of Industrial and Business Management, 15, 638-660. https://doi.org/10.4236/ajibm.2025.154031

Received: March 26, 2025 Accepted: April 27, 2025 Published: April 30, 2025

Copyright © 2025 by author(s) and Scientific Research Publishing Inc. This work is licensed under the Creative **Commons Attribution International** License (CC BY 4.0).

http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/ **Open Access**

٢

Abstract

This paper examines the current state and proposed solutions for employment-linked vocational training policies for workers in Ha Tinh province which is based on a theoretical framework at the local level. The study approaches these policies from the perspective of labor supply and demand coordination. Key policy solutions for the province include developing employment-linked vocational training programs, providing support for workers undergoing training, encouraging enterprise participation in vocational training, strengthening policies for VTIs, and fostering cooperation between the provincial government, businesses, and training centers. Given the current socio-economic context and workforce needs, the provincial government of Ha Tinh should align its vocational training policies with national regulations to ensure effectiveness.

Keywords

Vocational Training, Vocational Training Program, Policies on Employment-Linked Vocational Training for Employers in Ha Tinh

1. Introduction

Vocational education is an interdisciplinary concept or a specific feature of education and training, found in various educational and training institutions, including both formal and informal learning within enterprises, and is not necessarily linked to traditional educational domains. From this perspective, vocational training is closely associated to the social development of labor (Clarke & Winch, 2007). Vocational education and training (VET) play a crucial role in fostering self-employment, start-ups, income enhancement, productivity improvement,

and providing a skilled workforce for sustainable economic development (UNESCO, 2004; Card et al., 2010; Sala & Silva, 2013). Vocational training can be examined through three distinct perspectives: (1) the epistemological perspective, (2) the educational system perspective, and (3) the labor market-oriented perspective. It is regarded as "a means of preparing individuals for specific occupations and enabling effective participation in the world of work" (UNESCO, 2004) or "a means of equipping individuals with the necessary knowledge, expertise, skills, and/or competencies required in specific professions or, more broadly, in the labor market" (Cedefop, 2017).

The primary objective of employment-linked vocational training policies is to equip employees with the necessary skills to enhance their employability, specifically: (1) improve employees' vocational competencies; (2) strengthen the supply of skilled labor, ensuring alignment between workforce supply and labor market demands in terms of competence; and (3) anticipate and provide new skill which will be in need for future labor development. Consequently, vocational skills development is challenged by both the expanding labor force and the imperative to enhance labor productivity. Employment-linked vocational training policies include: (1) policies for the development of programs on employment-linked vocational training; (2) policies providing support to employees; (3) policies incentivizing enterprise participation in vocational training; (4) policies targeting vocational training institution (hereinafter referred as VTIs); and (5) policies fostering collaboration between local governments, enterprises, universities, and VTIs.

Extensive research has been conducted on vocational training and related policy frameworks to provide analytical foundations for vocational education and public administration on this domain. Several studies have examined national and central-level policies and plans for vocational training to address the workforce challenges, such as the work by Vernon (1985) while other institutional aspects of vocational training have been analyzed in studies by Tan & Nam (2013). Other research, including that of Oxfam (2017), has focused on policy design and implementation, as well as vocational training program development. Additionally, studies such as those conducted by the ILO (2009) have concentrated on performance monitoring and evaluation within vocational training systems. The World Bank (1996) has explored state management functions in vocational training but primarily from an interventionist perspective, focusing on policy implementation for specific target groups rather than a comprehensive analysis of state management across the policy cycle. Given these perspectives, local governments must base their employment-linked vocational training policies on the actual needs of workers, socio-economic conditions as well as State's policies and regulations to develop an appropriate approach.

2. Research Methodology

2.1. Approach and Research Framework

2.1.1. Research Approach

In examining employment-linked vocational training policies, this study employs

a systems perspective and a systematic analysis approach to investigate the province's vocational training policy framework as well as analyze analyzes the system of various factors influencing these policies—internal factors related to local government operations and external environmental factors impacting local government. Additionally, a micro-level perspective is applied in the analysis of public employment service policies. This involves a detailed analysis of the fundamental components of an employment policy, including: policy rationale and objectives; policy orientation and perspectives; actors and target groups of the policy; and policy solutions and instruments. To enhance policy effectiveness, the study also incorporates a set of criteria to assess employment policies in alignment with their intended objectives. Furthermore, this perspective is applied when conducting surveys of policy beneficiaries, as well as policymakers and practitioners responsible for designing and implementing employment-linked vocational training policies.

2.1.2. Research Framework

To study the employment-linked vocational training policies for employees, this research adopts a systematic approach to employment policies based on labor supply and demand connection policies.



The research framework is illustrated in **Figure 1** below:

Source: conducted by author.

Figure 1. Research framework on local vocational training policies.

2.2. Research Methodology

2.2.1. Data Collection Method

1) Secondary Data Collection

The study gathers secondary data from textbooks, scientific journals, doctoral dissertations, and academic research projects. Accordingly, methods of analysis, evaluation, and synthesis are employed at this stage. Additionally, the author also implemented interviews with researchers and experts in the field of voca-

tional training to update recent literature and new approaches on vocational training for rural labor; these interviews aimes at ensuring a comprehensive overview and identifying research gaps in the most scientific and rational manner. Moreover, secondary data are also sourced from official reports issued by the Department of Labor, Invalids, and Social Affairs (DOLISA), the Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (DARD), and the Department of Finance of Ha Tinh province and reports by the People's Committees of districts and cities, vocational education institutions, and overseas employment agencies in the province. Furthermore, relevant materials from other localities with labor market characteristics similar to those of Ha Tinh province are also utilized for the study purposes.

2) Primary Data Collection

Firstly, expert interviews are carried out at Ha Tinh Department of Labor, Invalids and Social Affairs and its district-level affliciated offices.

- *Target respondents*: officials from the Ha Tinh's Department of Labor, Invalids, and Social Affairs, Ha Tinh's Department of Agriculture and Rural Development, and its district-level affliciated offices across the province.

A total of 30 experts participated in the interviews, including: 8 experts from Ha Tinh's Department of Labor, Invalids, and Social Affairs (employed by the Employment and Labor Division, the Vocational Education and Gender Equality Division, and the Planning and Finance Division); 4 experts from Ha Tinh's Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (employed by the Office of the Department and the Planning and Finance Division); and 18 experts from 13 district-level Department of Labor, Invalids and Social Affairs in Ha Tinh province.

- *Interview Content*: Ha Tinh's policies on vocational training for the labor force.

- *Interview Methodology*: Direct interview with experts whose opinions are collected and synthesized. During the interviews, cross-checking is carried out to identify whether the opinions of certain expert are consent or contradictory to others. The interviews ranged from September 2024 to December 2024.

Secondly, interviews are carried out with managers on labor and employment in districts and town of Ha Tinh province

- *Target Respondents*: The study surveyed 80 managers on labor and employment from the provincial and district-level People's Committees, including 21 department-level managers from the Ha Tinh Department of Labor, Invalids, and Social Affairs; 15 department-level managers from the Department of Agriculture and Rural Development; 5 department-level managers from the Department of Finance; and 39 district-level managers from 13 districts in Ha Tinh province (three respondents per district).

- *Interview Content*: policies and policy implementation related to vocational training for the labor force under the administration of Ha Tinh province.

- Interview Methodology: A structured questionnaire was designed, followed

by a pilot survey involving 10 respondents to refine the questionnaire. The finalized survey was then distributed either in person or via email over a four-year period leading up to the survey timeframe. A total of 80 questionnaires were sent out, and all of them were collected with full validity. The survey was conducted between September 2024 and December 2024.

Thirdly, survey is carried out with vocationally trained workers in Ha Tinh provicne over the past three years.

- *Target Respondents*: 300 workers who completed vocational training at VTIs in Ha Tinh province.

- *Survey Content*: Workers' assessments after completing their vocational training at VTIs in Ha Tinh province.

- *Survey Methodology*: A structured questionnaire was developed, with a pilot survey conducted on 10 workers to refine the questionnaire. The finalized survey was distributed to VITs, and either in person or via email to workers who had completed vocational training within the past four years. A total of 400 questionnaires were distributed, with 300 valid responses collected. The survey was conducted between September 2024 and December 2024.

Fourthly, survey is carried out with VTIs in Ha Tinh province

- *Target Respondents*: 20 VTIs providing training for rural workers in Ha Tinh province, including 5 private institutions and 15 public institutions.

- *Survey Content*: Assessment by VTIs regarding the participation and engagement of organizations in vocational training for rural workers in Ha Tinh province.

- *Survey Methodology*: A structured questionnaire was designed and piloted with three VTIs. After refinement, the finalized questionnaire was distributed directly or via email to VTIs. A total of 20 valid responses were collected. The survey was conducted between September 2024 and December 2024.

Fifthly, survey is carried out with enterprises employing labor in Ha Tinh province

- Target Respondents: 70 organizations employing labor in Nghe An province.

- *Survey Conten*t: Assessment by labor-employing organizations regarding the quality of rural workers in Ha Tinh province.

- *Survey Methodology*: A structured questionnaire was designed and piloted with five labor-employing organizations. After refinement, the finalized questionnaire was distributed directly or via email to 100 labor-employing organizations. A total of 70 valid responses were collected. The survey was conducted between September 2024 and December 2024.

2.2.2. Data process and Analysis Method

The collected primary data was entered into Excel for statistical analysis. The data was structured into tables according to evaluation indicators to facilitate comparison and analysis. The methods of synthesis and modeling were employed to develop the analytical framework for provincial government management of vocational training for workers.

Expert consultations and interviews were conducted to refine the research framework and analyze the current state of government management in vocational training. Statistical analysis methods, including mean analysis, comparative analysis, cross-evaluation, time-series analysis, and case study analysis, were utilized to examine the current state of vocational training for workers in Ha Tinh province and corresponding government policies.

3. The Analysis and Evaluation of the Current Status of Employment-Linked Vocational Training Policies in Ha Tinh

3.1. Factors Impacting Employment-Linked Vocational Training Policies in Ha Tinh

Local-level employment-linked vocational training policies are significantly influenced by both internal and external factors, which can exert direct or indirect impacts. Therefore, analyzing the current state of employment-linked vocational training policies in Ha Tinh requires a thorough consideration of these factors to provide a comprehensive perspective on the policy process in the province.

a) Internal factors within the provincial government

The employment-linked vocational training policy in Ha Tinh is significantly impacted by internal factors within the provincial government. These factors include the commitment of provincial leadership to addressing employment issues; the strategic planning of local socio-economic development; the formulation and implementation of provincial employment policies; and the province's financial capacity. Empirical evidence suggests that these factors have a notable impact on the effectiveness and efficiency of employment-linked vocational training policies. This is demonstrated by the government's issuance of key regulatory documents tailored to the province, such as Decision No. 1363/QD-TTg (dated November 8, Ha Tinh People's Committee, 2022) by the Prime Minister, which mandates the review, adjustment, and supplementation of the planning on vocational education network in Ha Tinh for the 2021-2030 period, with a vision toward 2050. Additionally, the adoption of the Ha Tinh's Provincial Socio-Economic Development Master Plan for 2020-2030 has provided a strategic foundation for employmentlinked vocational training policy formulation; as a result, these policies advance significantly in comparison to the ones of previous period.

b) External environmental factors encircling provincial government

The external environment encircling Ha Tinh's government plays a crucial role in shaping its employment-linked vocational training policy, such as: the characteristics of the local labor force; the economic development in neighboring provinces such as Nghe An and Quang Binh; the national employment strategies and policies; the degree of decentralization in labor policy formulation; the support and coordination of relevant organizations, as well as the natural, economic, and social conditions of the province.

3.2. The Current Status of Employment-Linked Vocational Training Policies

3.2.1. Policies for the Development of Employment-Linked Vocational Training Policies

The policy on developing vocational training programs in Ha Tinh is issued under the provincial Human Resource Development Plan (2021-2025), in accordance with Resolution No. 46/NQ-HDND (dated December 16, Ha Tinh People's Council, 2021). This plan outlines a strategic direction for reforming training programs to align with standardized learning outcomes. Accordingly, vocational education and training institutions are required to modernize curricula, innovate teaching and instructional methods, and promote the willingness, activeness, creativity, and self-directed study among students. Additionally, these institutions shall target on the comprehensive development for learners. The training and capacitybuilding programs aim to equip learners with industry-relevant professional skills, responding to the demands of enterprises and organizations; and businesses are actively involved in the training process, ensuring that graduates are well-prepared to integrate into the workforce and fulfill the commitment with these enterprises.

The Plan No. 36/KH-HDND (dated February 15, Ha Tinh People's Council, 2022) outlines key policy provisions for executing the Vocational Education Development Strategy for Ha Tinh Province (2021-2025). Accordingly, the Provincial People's Committee mandates a review of existing training programs to modify, supplement, and update new knowledge, technologies, and teaching methodologies; to add new training programs tailored to the evolving needs of enterprises and the labor market; to finalize vocational curricula and teaching materials according to the reference to the system of programs and curricular customized for national and regional prioritized careers; for the VTIs to formulate and issue the programs and curricula for other remaining careers according to the national competency frameworks or occupational skill standards. VTIs engaged in rural workforce training must design curricula and teaching materials in alignment with national occupational skill standards, ensuring compatibility with local conditions and learner demographics.

The policy also stipulates that during the 2021-2025 period, Ha Tinh has been finalizing vocational training programs at the college and intermediate levels to meet national standards. Additionally, the province has introduced incentive policies to encourage VTIs to develop programs that equip final-year students with soft skills and foreign language proficiency.

A survey was conducted with the following target groups: VTIs (Group A - 70 respondents), management officials (Group B - 80 respondents), experts (Group C - 30 respondents), and workers (Group D - 300 respondents). The survey results on public employment services in Ha Tinh are presented in **Table 1** below.

According to the survey results, Ha Tinh has established strategic directions for developing employment-linked vocational training programs, with an average score of 4.53; however, the province has not yet implemented concrete measures

644

to support VTIs effectively, nor has it developed efficient mechanisms for collaboration between state management agencies, VTIs, and enterprises in program development. As a result, vocational training programs at these institutions have not been sufficiently practical in helping workers secure employment and do not fully align with the needs of enterprises. Some training programs fail to meet required standards, are not well-suited to trainees, and do not reflect the actual production conditions of the local economy.

Te diamon	C	Obser	vatio	ns		Me	ean		Overall	Sta	andard	dard deviation		
Indicator	А	В	С	D	А	В	С	D	mean	А	В	С	D	
There are strategic measures to develop employment-linked vocational training programs	70	80	30	299	4.6	4.7	4.3		4.53	0.86	0.79	0.92	0.89	
Concrete measures have been implemented to support VTIs in developing employment-linked training programs	70	80	30	298	2.5	2.5	2.3		2.40	0.88	0.87	0.89	0.94	
Practical measures have been introduced to foster collaboration between government agencies, VTIs, and enterprises in vocational training program development	70	80	30	299	2.6	2.4	2.3		2.45	0.83	0.82	0.85	0.92	
Vocational training programs at VTIs effectively help workers find jobs	70	80	30	297	3.6	3.1	2.8	2.5	2.90	0.92	0.93	0.94	0.85	
Vocational training programs at VTIs are practical for enterprises	70	80	30	298	4	3.5	2.8	2.4	2.98	0.85	0.86	0.85	0.89	

Table 1. Survey result on policies supporting employees in vocational training.

Source: investigation by author.

3.2.2. Policies Supporting Employees in Vocational Training

Ha Tinh has enacted a policy establishing the "Vocational Training and Education, Employment Support, and Livelihood Stabilization Fund for Residents Affected by Land Acquisition for Investment Projects within the Province". This policy was formalized under Decision No. 20/2011/QD-UBND, (dated July 19, Ha Tinh People's Committee, 2011).

The beneficiaries of this policy include households whose land has been acquired for investment projects within the province, where the reclaimed area exceeds 30% of their total residential land, agricultural land, forestry land, salt production land, or legally recognized aquaculture land, and households engaged in fishing who are required to transition to alternative occupations. The policy provides direct support to students enrolled in universities, colleges, and vocational secondary schools both within and outside the province, unemployed individuals of working age who are currently undergoing vocational training; job seekers who are unemployed at the time of application and wish to pursue vocational training. The policy also includes indirect support to enterprises that commit to independently providing training and employing laborers covered by this policy and public institutions responsible for career guidance, vocational counseling, and job placement services for individuals eligible under this policy.

The tuition support policy applies to vocational training programs at various levels, including university, college, professional secondary school, vocational college, vocational secondary school, and elementary vocational training. Beneficiaries of this policy include individuals enrolled in VTIs licensed by the government or employees trained directly by enterprises that recruit them for long-term employment.

The specific support levels depend on the type of training and training institution, as stipulated in Resolution 115/2023/NQ-HDND (dated December 8, Ha Tinh People's Council, 2023), specifically: University-level training, vocational college training: VND 6 million/person/course; Vocational college and vocational secondary school training: VND 4 million/person/course; Professional secondary school training: VND 3 million/person/course. The Vocational Training and Employment Support Fund disburses a one-time payment at the end of the training course to the trainee or a lump-sum payment to enterprises that meet the eligibility criteria, through the Vocational Training Card.

Several additional support policies are noteworthy, starting with the Decision No. 1313/QD-UBND (dated June 8, Ha Tinh People's Committee, 2023), which approves the list of vocational training programs at the elementary level and short-term courses (under three months) for the 2023-2025 period. This policy covers 146 occupations across five vocational groups (agriculture, forestry, and fisheries; technical and industrial sectors; commerce and services; culture and arts; and healthcare and beauty services), and has been established to encourage vocational training, professional development, and regulations on incentives for training, professional development, and attracting high-quality human resources for the period of 2023-2025. Another key policy is the Resolution No. 46/2021/NQ-HDND (dated December 16, Ha Tinh People's Council, 2021), which outlines incentives for training, professional development, and qualified workforce attraction. These policies prioritize short-term training, postgraduate education, and attracting skilled professionals to province's labor market. Key support measures include tuition subsidies, living and travel allowances, early salary increases, study materials, and other financial assistance.

The survey was conducted among four respondent groups: VTIs (Group A - 70 respondents), management officials (Group B - 80 respondents), experts (Group C - 30 respondents), and employees (Group D - 300 respondents). The results of the public employment service survey in ha Tinh are presented in **Table 2** below.

The survey results indicate positive recognition of the solutions supporting employees in vocational training, with an average score of 4.62. However, criteria on support policies only scored slightly above 3 points. This suggests that the province's vocational training support has not been effectively aligned with employment requirements. The current support level is not widely considered reasonable for employees and remains insufficient to encourage them to participate in vocational training. Moreover, the existing support mechanisms do not adequately facilitate VTIs in implementing policies. Notably, the diversification of support methods received the lowest rating, with a score of just 2.42.

Table 2. Investigation result on vocational training development policies.

T., Jt., 4.,	C	bser	vatio	ons		Me	ean		Overall	Sta	ndard	deviat	ion
Indicator	А	В	С	D	А	В	С	D	mean	А	В	С	D
Support solutions for vocational training and skill development have been implemented	70	80	30	299	4.7	4.7	4.5	4.5	4.6	0.92	0.82	0.87	0.78
Vocational training support is aligned with employment regulations	70	80	30	298	3.2	3.1	3.1	2.8	3.04	0.89	0.85	0.90	0.92
The current support level is reasonable, ensuring that trainees can cover their costs	70	80	30	299	3.5	3.2	3	2.7	3.10	0.82	0.79	0.93	0.89
The current support level is sufficient to encourage workers to participate in vocational training	70	80	30	297	2.9	3.5	3	2.9	3.02	0.89	0.91	0.95	0.87
Support mechanisms facilitate VTIs in policy implementation	70	80	30	298	2.5	3.6	3.1	3.2	3.18	0.87	0.89	0.85	0.86
Support mechanisms have been diversified based on trainee groups	70	80	30	297	2.5	2.4	2.5	2.4	2.42	0.91	0.89	0.84	0.83

Source: Investigation by author.

3.2.3. Incentives Policies Towards Enterprises' Participation in Vocational Training

This policy was issued under Decision No. 403/KH-UBND (dated September 17, Ha Tinh People's Committee, 2021) regarding the Vocational Training and Employment Support Fund, which regulates specific provisions of the policy. The target beneficiaries, including enterprises across all economic sectors; foreign-invested enterprises; cooperatives, cooperative alliances; and economic entities affiliated with socio-political and professional organizations, shall receive, self-organize vocational training, and arrange employment for workers who are holding vocational training cards (still active-5 years from the date of issuance) issued under the Fund's support program and for employees who have been employed at the enterprise for at least six months and fulfilled all social insurance and health insurance responsibilities. The support level follows the vocational training assistance for rural workers at enterprises and production and business establishments, as stipulated in Decision No. 236/QD-UBND (dated January 21, Ha Tinh People's Committee, 2013) on the list and financial support levels for vocational training at the elementary level and short-term vocational training (less than three months) at VTIs, as well as apprenticeship support at enterprises and production and business establishments.

The survey was conducted among three groups of respondents: Management

officials (Group A - 80 respondents); Experts (Group B - 30 respondents); and Enterprises (Group C - 300 respondents). The survey results regarding public employment services in Ha Tinh are presented in Table 3 below.

Table 3. Investigation results on policies supporting enterprises in vocational training provision.

Indicator	Observations			1	Mean		Overall mean	Standard deviat		iation
		В	С	А	В	С		А	В	С
There have been support solutions for enterprises in vocational training for workers	80	30	298	4.5	4.3	4.3	4.37	0.89	0.94	0.85
Support solutions ensure that enterprises meet the Necessary conditions to provide vocational training for workers	80	30	299	3.4	3	3.1	3.17	0.87	0.92	0.86
The current support level is sufficient to encourage enterprises to provide vocational training for workers	80	30	297	3.5	3	2.5	3.00	0.88	0.91	0.79
The support mechanisms facilitate enterprises in Implementing the policy	80	30	300	4	3.8	3.5	3.77	0.89	0.91	0.95

Source: Investigation by author.

The survey results indicate that the province has introduced positive solutions to support enterprises in vocational training (average score: 4.37), and the support mechanisms are relatively appropriate (average score: 3.77). However, the support measures have not yet ensured that enterprises meet the necessary conditions for providing vocational training to workers, as the assistance primarily focuses on financial support. Additionally, the current level of financial support remains inadequate to incentivize enterprises to actively engage in vocational training (average score: 3.0).

3.2.4. Policies Towards VTIs

a) The policy on developing the network and investment in VTIs

The policy on developing the network of VTIs (VTI) was issued under the Project on the Development of the vocational school and professional training System for the 2021-2025 Period. By the end of 2025, the network of VTIs is expected to be streamlined and consolidated, with an expanded training scale and a broader range of training disciplines. The policy aims to enhance the quality of vocational training, promote the socialization of vocational education activities, and encourage the participation of organizations, individuals, and society as a whole in the development of vocational training. Currently, the province has 28 VTIs, including: 3 colleges; 5 vocational secondary schools; 12 district-level centers for vocational training, career guidance, and continuing education; 3 non-public vocational training centers, and several centers affiliated with mass organizations and professional associations.

In addition, the province has implemented investment policies to support VTIs and attract funding for their development. Investments have been directed toward improving infrastructure at these institutions to better meet the vocational training needs of the labor force. Following the Project on the Development of the vocational school and professional training System for the 2021-2025 period, the Resolution No. 70/2022/NQ-HDND (dated December 16, Ha Tinh People's Council, 2022) was enacted to approve the "Planning of the Vocational education network in Ha Tinh province".

A survey was conducted among three respondent groups: managerial officials (Group A—80 respondents), experts (Group B—30 respondents), and VTIs (Group C—20 institutions). The survey results regarding public employment services in Ha Tinh are presented in **Table 4** below.

Table 4. Survey results on policies for network development and investment in VTIs.

Indicator	Observations				Mear	L	Overall mean	Standard deviation		
	А	В	С	А	В	С		А	В	С
There have been optimal solutions for developing the network of VTIs.	80	30	20	3.6	3.5	3	3.37	0.91	0.89	0.87
The network development solutions have contributed to establishing a sufficient number of VTIs with adequate infrastructure capacity.	80	30	19	3.2	3	3	3.07	0.89	0.90	0.87
Investment solutions for developing the infrastructure of VTIs have met the needs of these institutions.	80	30	17	3.8	3	2.9	3.23	0.89	0.90	0.83
Investment solutions for infrastructure development have helped ensure sufficient funding for VTIs.	80	30	20	3	2.5	2.5	2.67	0.92	0.79	0.89

Source: Investigation by author.

The survey results indicate that the province has implemented relatively effective solutions for developing the network of VTIs, with an average score of 3.37. The network development solutions have contributed to the establishment of VTIs network with adequate infrastructure capacity at a moderate level (average score: 3.07). The province's solutions on investing and developing the institutions' infrastructure have also met the needs of these institutions at a moderate level (average score: 3.23). However, provincial investment has not ensured sufficient funding for VTIs, as reflected in a lower average score of 2.67.

b) Policies supporting the training activities at VTIs

The provincial government has prioritized and enacted support policies for training activities at VTIs through several official decisions, including Decision No. 403/2021/KH-UBND (dated September 17, Ha Tinh People's Committee, 2021). Under this policy, institutions tasked with workforce training for Vung Anh Economic Zone receive additional financial support for training costs (excluding tuition fees). This support applies to all students who are permanent residents of Ha Tinh province, in accordance with school regulations and the Ministry of Education and Training's guidelines for each academic year and specific training programs. Additionally, Ha Tinh University benefits from further financial support beyond the aforementioned policies. Specifically, the university re-

ceives funding for promotional and student recruitment activities targeting the 1,280 allocated enrollment quotas.

A survey was conducted among three respondent groups: Management officials (Group A—80 respondents); Experts (Group B—30 respondents), and VTIs (Group C—20 institutions). The findings of the survey on public employment services in Ha Tinh are presented in **Table 5** below.

1	able 5. Investigation result	on policies supporting v 11s.	

Table 5 Investigation result on policies supporting VTIs

Indicator		Observations		Mean			Overall mean	1		-
		В	С	А	В	С		А	В	С
The training support solutions for VTIs are optimal.	80	30	20	3.4	3.1	3.3	3.27	0.92	0.89	0.88
The training support solutions for VTIs have contributed to improving vocational training outcomes.	80	30	19	3.5	3.6	2.9	3.33	0.91	0.82	0.86
The training support solutions for VTIs are based on the actual operational status of VTIs.	80	30	17	3.7	3.2	3	3.30	0.88	0.91	0.87
Investment solutions for VTIs infrastructure development have helped ensure sufficient funding for facility investments.	80	30	20	4	4.1	3.2	3.77	0.90	0.98	0.79

Source: Investigation by author.

The survey findings indicate that all criteria scored above 3 points, with the highest score (3.77) for the criterion "The solutions supporting the vocational training at VTIs have ensured fairness among training institutions". The criteria assessing the optimality of support solutions, their contribution to improving vocational training outcomes, and the appropriateness of support levels for VTIs received scores around 3.3. These evaluations demonstrate that the current support solutions for VTIs remain insufficient to strongly incentivize institutions to actively participate in vocational training.

c) Policies supporting lecturers at VTIs

In recent years, Ha Tinh province has issued several decisions on policies to support lecturers at VTIs. A survey was conducted among three respondent groups: management officials (Group A—80 respondents), experts (Group B—30 respondents), and VTIs (Group C—20 institutions). The survey results on public employment services in Ha Tinh are presented in **Table 6** below.

Obs	serva	Mean			Overall mean		Standard deviation		
А	В	С	А	В	С		А	В	С
80	30	19	3.2	2.8	2.9	2.97	0.85	0.89	0.91
80	30	20	3.6	3.2	3.1	3.30	0.87	0.86	0.91
80	30	18	4.5	4.8	4.7	4.67	0.85	0.90	0.86
	A 80 80	A B 80 30 80 30	A B C 80 30 19 80 30 20	A B C A 80 30 19 3.2 80 30 20 3.6	A B C A B 80 30 19 3.2 2.8 80 30 20 3.6 3.2	80 30 19 3.2 2.8 2.9 80 30 20 3.6 3.2 3.1	Observation Mean mean A B C A B C 80 30 19 3.2 2.8 2.9 2.97 80 30 20 3.6 3.2 3.1 3.30	Observation Mean mean definition A B C A B C A 80 30 19 3.2 2.8 2.9 2.97 0.85 80 30 20 3.6 3.2 3.1 3.30 0.87	Observation Mean mean deviati A B C A B C A B

Table 6. Survey result on policies supporting lecturers at VTIs.

Source: Survey result by author.

The survey findings indicate that the support policies at VTIs have been highly equitable for lecturers, with a mean score of 4.67; however, the level of the support provided has only moderately met lecturers' needs (mean score of 3.3). Additionally, the current support policies are not considered optimal given the existing conditions (mean score of 2.97).

d) Policies on information provision to VTIs

The policy on providing information to VTIs to support employment-linked vocational training has not yet been a primary concern of Ha Tinh province. However, the province has established regulations on data collection as a basis for formulating employment policies and vocational training plans for training institutions. Specifically, Decision No. 3178/QD-UBND (dated October 14, Ha Tinh People's Committee, 2013) under the Employment and Labor Export Program of Ha Tinh Province, includes provisions on data collection regarding the current status and demand for labor recruitment of enterprises, organizations, and individuals employing workers according to employees' occupation and training level. This serves as a foundation for developing plans on training, allocation and utilization of human resources effectively. Additionally, the decision mandates the collection of fundamental data on labor conditions, employment and unemployment status, professional qualifications, and annual workforce fluctuations to build a labor market information database, which serves as a basis for planning the employment policy formulation and vocational training at VTIs.

A survey was conducted among the respondent groups, including management officials (Group A—80 respondents), experts (Group B—30 respondents), and VTIs (Group C—20 institutions). The survey results on public employment services in Ha Tinh are presented in Table 7 below.

Indicator		Observation		Mean			Overall mean	Standard deviation		
		В	С	А	В	С		А	В	С
The solution on information provision to VTIs is sufficient, timely, and effective.	80	30	19	2.5	2.6	2.1	2.40	0.92	0.90	0.91
The solution on information provision to VTIs aligns with the needs of the VTIs.	80	30	20	2	2.1	2.1	2.07	0.89	0.92	0.91

Table 7. Survey results on policies on information provision to VTIs.

Source: Survey result by author.

The survey findings indicate that the current on information provision solutions for VTIs received a low score in terms of comprehensiveness, timeliness, and effectiveness (2.40) and have largely failed to meet the information needs of VTIs (2.07).

3.3. Evaluation on the Impact of Employment-Linked Vocational Training Policies in Ha Tinh

The employment-linked vocational training policies in Ha Tinh province have

played a significant role in achieving the province's overall employment policy objectives. This impact is reflected in key indicators such as the number of employees receiving employment-linked vocational training each year, the proportion of trained employees, the number of enterprises receiving vocational training support, the number of individuals benefiting from vocational training support, and the number of VTI) receiving support for vocational training activities. Ha Tinh has actively implemented vocational training policies, and the measures adopted in recent years have led to notable progresses.

Indicator	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2020-2024
New vocational training enrollments	18.025	18.398	20.926	15.254	16.686	89.289
Including:						
Vocational college	829	809	802	905	906	4251
Vocational secondary school	4.987	4.980	4.851	4.816	4.646	24280
Primary and short-term vocational training	12.209	12.609	15.273	9.533	11.134	60758
Including:						
Vocational training for rural workers	1.420	3.814	11.320	585	592	17731
Vocational training for ethnic minority youth	5	7	6	13	18	49
Vocational training for workers affected by land recovery			65	167	184	416
Vocational training for persons with disabilities	365	465	420	263	349	1862
Vocational college and secondary school	5816	5789	5653	5721	5552	28531
Growth rate of new enrollments in vocational college and secondary school	10.2	-8.5	-9.1	10.5	13.6	

Table 8. Results on the new vocational training enrollment in Ha Tinh province (Person-times).

Source: The Department of Labor-War Invalids, and Social Affairs of Ha Tinh province.

During the period from 2020 to 2024, VTIs provided vocational training for a total of 89,289 participants, including: 4.251 individuals in vocational colleges; 24.280 individuals in vocational secondary schools; 60.758 individuals participated in short-term and continuous vocational training; and 17731 individuals in agricultural sector according to the Decision No. 1956/QD-TTg (dated November 17, Prime Minister of Vietnam, 2009). The beneficiaries of these programs included individuals from low-income households, policy-benefited families, individuals affected by land recovery, persons with disabilities, and those from near-poor households. Upon completing their training, employees shall acquire vocational knowledge and skills, enabling them to secure employment, engage in self-employment, and enhance productivity on cultivated land (Table 8).

According to the data on the implementation of vocational training policies by the Department of Labor, Invalids, and Social Affairs of Ha Tinh province, the annual number of workers receiving employment-linked vocational training tends to increase, from 18.500 workers in 2020 to 24.761 workers in 2024. However, annual labor market survey reports from the General Statistics Office demonstrate that the proportion of trained labor in Ha Tinh remains relatively low, reaching only 70% by 2024 (**Table 9**).

Table 9. The result of emp	loyment-linked vocational training	and trained workforce.

Indicator	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2020-2024
The number of workers receiving employment-linked vocational training each year (persons)	18.500	19.300	22.789	25.167	24.761	112.254
Percentage of trained labor force (%)	70.0	71.2	73.3	75.5	78	70.0

Source: The Department of Labor-War Invalids, and Social Affairs of Ha Tinh province.

Table 10.	Result o	n vocational	training	support	for workers.

Indicator	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024
Number of vocational supported trainees (person-times)	7.000	7.800	8.000	6.800	5.900
Including					
Short-term vocational training (person-times)	980	1.600	880	1.400	740
Elementary-level vocational training (person-times)	4.200	4.600	4.800	3.900	3.100
Intermediate-level vocational training (person-times)	1.000	1.500	1.600	1.100	1.800
College-level vocational training (person-times)	820	100	720	400	260
Financial support (billion VND)	12.0	13.5	14.0	15.0	10.0

Source: The Department of Labor-War Invalids, and Social Affairs of Ha Tinh province.

Reports from the Ha Tinh Department of Labor, War Invalids, and Social Affairs on vocational training support indicate that, on average, approximately 7.100 workers receive vocational training support annually. The majority of these beneficiaries are enrolled in elementary-level vocational training, while those who engage in intermediate-level vocational training accounts for only one-quarter of the total and the proportion of workers receiving support for college-level vocational training remains insignificant (**Table 10**).

Table 11. Result demonstrating the support to enterprises in vocational training.

Indicator	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024
Number of enterprises receiving vocational training support (enterprises)	15	18	22	21	23
Number of workers trained by enterprises (instances)	302	361	412	430	398
Total support funding (thousand VND)	169.500	182.500	235.000	227.500	294.000

Source: The Department of Labor-War Invalids, and Social Affairs of Ha Tinh province.

The results of vocational training support for enterprises indicate modest outcomes, as enterprises' enthusiasm for engaging in vocational training is still limited. The number of workers trained directly by enterprises was only 398 individuals in 2024 and local government support funding under the aforementioned policies remained a small amount of approximately 294 million VND in 2024 (Ta-

ble 11).

Table 12. Result of vocational training support for VTIs.

Indicator		2021	2022	2023	2024	2020-2024
Total number of VTIs receiving vocational training support (institutions)	30	30	26	26	20	
Total funding for vocational training support from the state budget (billion VND)		20	20	15	10	85
Including:						
Training cost support (billion VND)	18	18	18	16.5	9	79.5
Enrollment and promotion cost support (billion VND)		0	0	0	0	0
Support for other activities (billion VND)	2	2	2	1,5	1	8.5
11						

Source: The Department of Labor-War Invalids, and Social Affairs of Ha Tinh province.

During the period 2020-2024, approximately 30 VTIs in the province received support for vocational training, with a total funding of VND 85 billion, primarily allocated to training costs (approximately VND 79.5 billion) (Table 12).

The province also provided support for VTIs in organizing provincial-level vocational teacher competitions with the participation of over 200 lecturers and staff members. Additionally, the provincial training funding is allocated to: 69 lecturers in pursuing their master's degrees in specialized fields; 34 lecturers teaching key occupations; 51 lecturers in Chinese language and soft skills; 6 lecturers received advanced vocational training in Australia and Malaysia; 3 lecturers attended advanced English language training at the British Council and 50 lecturers and staffs at VTIs for their training of foreign language proficiency.

District-level vocational training centers facilitated career transition training for lecturers in accordance with the Job Position Scheme. Although the quality of lecturers at VTIs has improved, challenges remain, including a shortage of full-time lecturers and structural imbalances in faculty composition, particularly in district-level vocational training and career orientation centers (**Table 13**).

Table 13.	Results o	of support f	or lecturers and	management staff at	VTIs.

Indicator	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2020-2024
Number of vocational training lecturers and management staff receiving training and professional development (person-times)	200	220	110	230	100	860
Total funding (million VND)	180	210	99	207	89	785
Including:						0
Central government budget (million VND)	180	210	99	207	89	785
Local government budget (million VND)	0	0	0	0	0	0

654

Source: The Department of Labor-War Invalids, and Social Affairs of Ha Tinh province.

4. Several Policy Measures on Employment-Linked Vocational Training in Ha Tinh Province

Based on the analysis and assessment of the current status of employment-linked vocational training policies in Ha Tinh over the past period, it is evident that to ensure vocational education institutions provide the most optimal and relevant training for the workforce, the employment-linked vocational training policies must be more comprehensively formulated. Accordingly, the provincial government should implement more specific policies regarding employment-linked vocational training, including the following:

Firstly, policy solutions for the development of employment-linked vocational training programs

To ensure the effective integration of vocational training programs with employment opportunities, Ha Tinh province must implement policies that provide both strategic direction and specific measures for developing vocational training programs at VTIs within the province: policies that support enterprises and VTIs in developing training programs through financial assistance/training program and facilitating enterprises and VTIs to implement their pre-designed training curricula.

Additionally, Ha Tinh's policy framework should be refined to guide the development of vocational training programs. This requires establishing broad directives for innovating vocational training curricula, such as: Developing vocational training programs in alignment with local economic development policies; Innovating vocational training curricula to enhance workers' professional skills; Adapting vocational training programs to meet the actual workforce quality demands of enterprises within the province. As a consequence, the provincial government shall issue guidelines for VTIs and enterprises to design short-term vocational training programs that address the skill requirements of jobs in enterprises (these programs may be developed, conducted, or outsourced by enterprises themselves). Furthermore, VTIs and enterprises shall develop the selflearning skills among workers, equipping them with fundamental competencies such as calculation, digital literacy, teamwork, and problem-solving skills.

Secondly, the policy solutions for supporting workers in vocational training

It is essential for Ha Tinh province to establish a policy framework to support the employment-linked vocational training as the guidelines for all support solutions on local vocational trainees. This framework should outline the perspectives, objectives, and principles that act as the fundamentals for future vocational training support policies of the province. This is for the uttermost purpose of providing training for labors and support labors according to the requirements on employment outcomes (either new jobs or job change). The province should conduct research and surveys to identify and regulate a list of growing industries, sectors aligned with local economic development strategies, and key industries that are developed in neighboring provinces. Based on these findings, Ha Tinh shall expand its current scope of vocational training support (mainly households engaged in agriculture, forestry, salt production, and aquaculture whose land has been reclaimed, as well as fishing households requiring occupational transitions) to those seeking to participate in training programs that align with the approved list of priority occupations established by the province.

Thirdly, policy solutions for supporting enterprises' participation in vocational training

The provincial government, in perceiving the critical role of enterprises in vocational training, shall issue appropriate policies on employment-linked vocational training. It is explained that, when enterprises actively participate in vocational training, employment outcomes for workers are better secured, mitigating the risk of unemployment caused by skill mismatches or training programs that fail to meet market demands; meanwhile, from the enterprise perspective, this collaboration shall ensure a steady supply of skilled labor.

To encourage enterprises to actively engage in vocational training, the province should introduce supportive policies that incentivize their involvement in curriculum development; assignment of their experts as instructors at VTIs and establishment of training workshops for VTIs as the province's support on training activities at vocational institutions.

The province should implement incentive mechanisms to encourage enterprises to collaborate with VTIs by aligning training programs with industry-specific output standards. Specific incentives may include financial support for training costs and tax benefits, such as allowing enterprises to deduct vocational training expenses when contracting training programs with VTIs. Moreover, in line with the trend of socialization in education, the province should introduce policies that incentivize big enterprises, enterprises in economic zone and industrial cluster to establish their own VTIs to cater to their workforce demands. Furthermore, the government should facilitate investment in vocational training by joint ventures and wholly foreign-owned enterprises. A notable approach is the "school within the enterprise" model, which highlights the enterprise's direct role in training, where experienced technicians and skilled engineers serve as instructors, guiding trainees using enterprise-owned machinery and equipment.

Additionally, enterprises should be granted the autonomy to assess skills and issue vocational training certificates to graduates from their in-house training programs. The province should establish more attractive financial support schemes for enterprises that cannot set up dedicated VTIs but still conduct in-house training for their employees. Support mechanisms may include per-capita training subsidies, payroll-based financial assistance, or preferential credit policies, all of which could help alleviate financial constraints in vocational training.

Fourthly, policies solutions for VTIs

According to the development objectives on VTIs for the 2021–2030 period, 16 out of 21 vocational education institutions in the province have developed implementation plans for the Digital Transformation Program in Vocational Education and Training by 2025, with a vision toward 2030. Additionally, 85% of educators

and managerial staff are expected to develop digital competencies, while 71% of vocational education management activities are set to be digitized.

To achieve these targets, the province should implement policies that promote the socialization of VTIs and enhance their engagement in vocational training. It is also necessary for the province to study and issue the policies on establishing the local VTI network, focusing on two main solution groups: (1) Expanding the development of non-public VTIs; and (2) Strengthening the capacity of public VTIs.

Regarding policies on non-public VTIs development

The province should focus on policies that simplify administrative procedures related to the establishment, operation, and dissolution of non-public VTIs; policies that support land-use and land-access for the VTIs to build their workshops, libraries, and practical training centers; technical support policies for non-public VTIs (including assistance to vocational training curriculum and materials, and capacity-building programs for lecturers and managerial staff). Furthermore, the refining and supplementing of several policies to support vocational trainees, which ensure the same access to financial support (tuition and scholarship...) for students at either non-public institutions or public institutions, is one of the critical strategies. A particular emphasis should be placed on policies that encourage the establishment of VTIs within enterprises, particularly in industrial zones, as discussed in enterprise-focused vocational training policies. Additionally, the province could explore and propose policies allowing non-public VTIs under socialization programs to charge training fees from entities employing their graduates.

Regarding policies for enhancing the vocational training capacity of public institutions

✓ The province should adopt a strong policy stance to limit the proliferation of non-public VTIs, thereby establishing a hierarchical system within the vocational education sector. Firstly, resources should be prioritized for investment in key VTIs with high training capacity to supply highly skilled labor for the province's strategic economic sectors. Secondly, efforts should be directed toward maintaining and strengthening VTIs that offer training in widely applicable professions, catering to the mass labor demand of local enterprises.

✓ Financial support mechanisms for VTI instructors should be substantial enough to partially compensate for training costs and incentivize continuous professional development. Additionally, policies should facilitate the transfer of teaching methodologies and specialized skills from reputable domestic and international vocational institutions to key VTIs within the province.

✓ The province should provide interest rate subsidies and loan support to enable VTIs to independently invest in modern training equipment, ensuring alignment with enterprise production technologies and adherence to national and international standards. Furthermore, key vocational schools should receive preferential budget allocations from local government funds to enhance their physical infrastructure.

Fifthly, Policy Solutions on strengthening collaboration across provincial authorities, enterprises, and VTIs

For the effective implementation of the four policy groups related to employment-linked vocational training, the province may consider a fifth solution focused on fostering collaboration among provincial authorities, enterprises, and VTIs.

The province should explore the establishment of a Coordination and Support center for workforce training and development, serving as a bridge between VTIs and enterprises within the province. This center would encourage and facilitate partnerships in vocational training. Additionally, policies should be introduced to incentivize enterprises to proactively report their annual workforce demand to Ha Tinh Department of Labor, Invalids, and Social Affairs; as a consequence, this would enable VTIs to tailor their training programs according to the real labor market demands. Furthermore, VTIs should be encouraged not only to proactively engage with enterprises to sign training contracts based on industry needs but also to establish departments dedicated to relations with enterprises to strengthen their role in coordinating labor supply and demand through vocational training. Provincial authorities must prioritize the development of a local labor market information system and be connected to the national and regional databases, ensuring better alignment between vocational training programs and actual labor market demands.

5. Conclusion

The increasingly fierce competition in the goods and services market has led businesses to increasingly demand for highly qualified workforce while also improving job quality. Therefore, employment policies in Ha Tinh must balance the quantity of job creation with job quality enhancement. Three key aspects determine the indicator on quality of employment solutions: Policies to create job opportunities based on economic development and labor export market seeking strategies; Policies ensuring essential prerequisites for employment, such as job-creating credit programs, vocational training, and information on labor market; and Policies to facilitate labor supply-demand connections, including the development of employment services, particularly public employment services. Thus, Ha Tinh's employment-linked vocational training policies must be grounded in comprehensive practical evidence, aligning with the need and expectation of the labors, and most importantly, focusing on employment outcomes. Any employment policy should be formulated based on thorough labor market surveys, assessments of enterprises, vocational training institutions, and employment service providers.

Conflicts of Interest

The author declares no conflicts of interest regarding the publication of this paper.

References

- Card, D., Kluve, J., & Weber, A. (2010). Active Labour Market Policy Evaluations: A Meta-Analysis. *The Economic Journal, 120*, F452-F477. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-0297.2010.02387.x
- Cedefop (2017). *The Changing Nature and Role of Vocational Education and Training in Europe. Volume 1: Conceptions of Vocational Education and Training: An Analytical Framework.* Publications Office, Cedefop Research Paper No 63.
- Clarke, L., & Winch, C. (2007). Vocational Education: Conceptual Differences between Britain and Germany. In J. J. Beichel, & K. Fees (Eds.), *Bildung oder outcome?* (pp. 75-90). Centaurus Verlag & Media. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-86226-308-0_5</u>
- Ha Tinh People's Committee (2011, July 19). Decision No. 20/2011/QD-UBND on the Establishment of the Fund for Vocational Training, Job Support, and Livelihood Stabilization for People Affected by Land Acquisition for Investment Projects in the Province.
- Ha Tinh People's Committee (2013, January 21). Decision No. 236/QD-UBND on the List and Level of Financial Support for Elementary-Level Vocational Training, Short-Term Training (Less than 3 Months) at Vocational Institutions, and Vocational Training Support at Enterprises and Production Facilities.
- Ha Tinh People's Committee (2013, October 14). *Decision No. 3178/QD-UBND on the Employment and Labor Export Program of Ha Tinh Province to 2020.*
- Ha Tinh People's Committee (2021, September 17). *Decision No. 403/2021/QD-UBND on the Development of Human Resources in Ha Tinh Province, Period 2020-2025.*
- Ha Tinh People's Council (2021, December 16). *Resolution No. 46/NQ-HDND on Human Resource Development Planning of Ha Tinh Province for the Period 2021-2025.*
- Ha Tinh People's Committee (2022, November 8). *Decision No. 1363/QD-TTg on Approval of Ha Tinh Provincial Planning for the Period 2021-2030, with a Vision to 2030.*
- Ha Tinh People's Council (2022, February 15). *Plan No. 36/KH-HDND on the Strategies to Develop the Vocational Education in Ha Tinh Province for the Period of 2021-2025.*
- Ha Tinh People's Council (2022, December 16). *Resolution No. 70/2022/NQ-HDND Approving the Vocational Education Network Planning of Ha Tinh Province.*
- Ha Tinh People's Committee (2023, June 8). *Decision No. 1313/QD-UBND on the List of Vocational Training Programs at the Elementary Level and Short-Term Courses (under Three Months) for the 2023-2025 Period.*
- Ha Tinh People's Council (2023, December 8). Resolution No. 115/2023/NQ-HDND Amending and Supplementing a Number of Articles of Resolution No. 70/2022/NQ-HDND on Policies to Support Vocational Training and Job Creation in Ha Tinh Province, Period 2022-2025.
- ILO (2009). *Rural Skills Training: A Generic Manual on Training for Rural Economic Empowerment.* Publications of the International Labor Office.
- Oxfam (2017). Improving the Effectiveness of Vocational Training for Rural Laborers to Reduce Poverty in Ethnic Minority Areas. Poverty Policy Monitoring and Analysis Project. Hong Duc Publishing House.
- Prime Minister of Vietnam (2009, November 27). Decision No. 1956/QD-TTg Approving the Project "Vocational Training for Rural Workers until 2020."
- Sala, H., & Silva, J. I. (2013). Labor Productivity and Vocational Training: Evidence from Europe. *Journal of Productivity Analysis*, 40, 31-41. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11123-012-0304-0
- Tan, J., & Nam, Y. J. (2013). Pre-Employment Technical and Vocational Education and

- Training: Fostering Relevance, Effectiveness, and Efficiency. In R. Almeida, J. Behrman, & D. Robalino (Eds.), *The Right Skills for the Job?* (pp. 67-103). The World Bank.
- UNESCO (2004). International Experts Meeting: Learning for Work, Citizenship, and Sustainability. UNESCO, Bonn-Germany.
- Vernon Jr., M. B. (1985). *Rural Labor Markets: The Role of Government*. Cornell University ILR School.
- World Bank (1996). *Skills for Productivity: Vocational Education and Training in Developing Countries.* Oxford University Press.